

CSCH President's Remarks 1992

Recovering Religious Experience: Some Reflections on Methodology

MARGUERITE VAN DIE

That religion in Canada is moving into the mainstream of historical discourse is thankfully a commonplace observation today. Long acknowledged as central to the history of French-speaking Canada, religion in English Canada has belatedly, but surprisingly quickly, aroused the interest of historians, as witnessed by an increasing number of graduate students entering the field, the steady growth of monographs and a remarkable output of historiographical articles analysing the interaction of religion with other dimensions of Canadian culture.¹

A recent survey of the growing literature on women and religion in Canada by Ruth Compton Brouwer (along with over half of this year's CSCH programme) reminds us that a second barrier as well has been dismantled, and that gender has now come to be included as a significant category in the study of religion.² Such revision enriches our dialogue, and I can think of no better place than this annual conference to remind ourselves that the work each of us does in isolation, and often with some frustration, is part of a larger process which continues to show gratifying results.

However, the title of this last session of the programme, "Ongoing Questions" also reminds us, with what may be the residue of a Calvinist or Jansenist heritage, that while progress has been made, the "heavenly city"

Historical Papers 1992: Canadian Society of Church History

is still a long distance away. Indeed, like Christian in Bunyan's *Pilgrim's Progress*, as we travel hopefully, each barrier we cross appears often to reveal to us another, yet more intractable. It is thanks in large part to refinement of critical theory in social history, including the increasingly sophisticated use of categories such as class and gender, that religion has come to be recognized as a significant force in the modernization of western society. While this has helped turn religion into a valid and tantalizing field of scholarly inquiry, there is the danger of uncritically applying to its study theories intended primarily to clarify socio-economic change. Thus we fail to do justice to the complexity of religious experience and its subtle interaction with culture.

This would not be the first time that the prevailing understanding of reality distorts the historian's vision. In 1984 in a seminal paper, "On Seeing and Not Seeing: A Case of Historical Invisibility," feminist historian, Ann Firor Scott pointed out the impact of patriarchy in making invisible the activities of women in providing leadership in moral reform and benevolent societies in nineteenth-century America.³ Today in a secular age, it can be argued that historians face substantially the same problem in recovering the transcendent, spiritual dimension of men and women's past religious experience. The need and the means to bring out this dimension in the writing of religious history is then the ongoing question which I want to place very briefly before us today. While it repeats essentially the topic of this morning's panel discussion, "How should church historians do church history?" my approach will be different, and will draw on my own field of current research, the study of evangelical Protestantism and the family in Ontario from 1830-1885.⁴ As such, these brief reflections are also a response to the request by this year's programme director, that rather than present a formal address, I simply speak a little about some of my current research.

A study of religion and the family adopts as its central point of investigation not the public world of the institutional church and the workplace, but rather the domestic space occupied by men, women and children, and moves from there to exploring its interaction with the public world. The resources available to understand the domestic world are many and eclectic – from examining the advertisements and lists of adult and children's literature in religious periodicals to reconstructing the theological perimeters of people's attitude to life and to death. Up to this point the lion's share of my research time and thought has been devoted to three

sources: obituaries; personal material of a more detailed nature such as private correspondence, published and unpublished diaries, spiritual journals, autobiographies and biographies; and finally contemporary tracts, monographs, and articles in the periodical press in which church hierarchy defined religious belief, behaviour, gender and family relations.

Not surprisingly, given the topic, as well as the personal and private nature of many of the primary sources, much of my methodology has been informed by some of the approaches adopted by historians of gender, or to be more exact, by some of the ongoing feminist critique. Influenced by postmodern philosophy and deconstruction, revisionist feminist critical theory, such as that advanced by Joan Wallach Scott has urged the need to broaden gender as an analytical category and abandon the search for single origins in favour of conceptual processes “so interconnected that they cannot be disentangled.”⁵

This replacement of earlier dichotomies such as the state and the family, the public and the private, male and female by an approach which still assumes gender as a central organizing principle but also accepts the organic nature of life, and the interconnectedness of human experience is especially congenial to historians of evangelicalism. The more inclusive approach to gender, for example, draws us to explore the ambiguities inherent in the fact that though unequal in society, spiritually men and women were seen to be equal before God, and as sinful creatures shared in the need for salvation. The organic understanding of reality too dovetails with the evangelical acceptance of the transcendent as an organizing principle, whereby all of life, the sacred and the secular, the individual and the community, this world and the hereafter were joined together into one seamless whole. Finally, this ongoing revisionism takes seriously two basic principles of feminist canon which are also necessary for the reconstruction of religious experience: listening to women’s [and men’s] own words, and the importance of reconstructing not only isolated events, but a person’s complete life cycle.⁶

All of this – the importance of being open to our sources first on their own terms, and only then searching for an appropriate critical theory, of recognizing the continuity of experience, the interconnectedness or organic nature of reality – all of this may be simply common sense. Yet when we apply this approach consistently to the reconstruction of religious experience, and only thereafter draw on, what for secular historians are the more familiar categories of gender and class, the implications for the

history of religion are significant. As I am beginning to recognize in my own work, such an approach can lead to the revision of earlier studies in which gender and class served as the central categories.

Let me structure this approach and its implications around one example, familiar to many. Attempting to chart the changes in women's economic, social, and political position, feminist historians such as Carroll Smith-Rosenberg have pointed to evangelical women's enthusiastic participation in the revivals of the Second Great Awakening and the opportunities these provided to engage in unconventional and anti-ritualistic behaviour. Occurring in America's growing urban centres at a time of transition from an agrarian based to a commercial and industrial economy, these revivals were seen as a brief hiatus of freedom for women before they were reintegrated into a narrowly circumscribed private sphere. Commonly referred to as the "Cult of True Womanhood," theirs was a world, "bound by kitchen and nursery, overlaid with piety and purity, and crowned with subservience."⁷

Initially compelling, this reading of the impact of nineteenth-century economic change has since come under review by other feminist scholars who point out that its basic tenet, the separation of spheres which labelled women as private beings bears little relation to the actual lives of many nineteenth-century women.⁸ However, it also fails to do justice to women's religious experience, and to the pattern which evangelical women themselves placed on their lives. Take for example, this brief introduction written in Lanark County in 1861 by a daughter to the memoir of her Methodist mother:

My dear Mother, Mrs. Margaret Hammond, being near the close of her life, and looking back upon it, considers that she is called upon to leave her testimony for the glory of God, to the power of his grace, who called her in her youth and brought her from darkness to light and from the thralldom of sin into the glorious liberty of the children of God, and sustained her in her pilgrimage even down to old age . .

Her daughter,
Sarah Jane⁹

"The glorious liberty" experienced by Margaret Hammond in conversion was in the first place conditioned by and in response to her

understanding of a world which transcended time and space, but which also interpenetrated the lives of ordinary men and women. To reconstruct the meaning of conversion for Methodist women such as Margaret Hammond and the evangelical women whose behaviour has been of interest to feminist scholars, it is imperative to place the experience of conversion within the wider context of evangelical piety. Such an approach, implied already in Sarah Jane's use of the term "pilgrimage" entails a reading of the past which looks not just at the brief but glorious moment of conversion which figures so prominently in current feminist historiography, but at the continuity which religion provided in life.

In Ontario, in the years 1830 to 1885, the period of my study, this is doubly significant. A survey of sermon and periodical literature shows that in a society of recent immigrants, evangelical clergy placed a strong emphasis on the practical, ethical nature of conversion. Concerned to combat what they considered the excessive individualism of North American life, and wishing to maintain continuity with the more conservative religious life in Britain, they took pains to link conversion to its ethical expression of a life of service.¹⁰ Secondly, by this period too, the majority of those who experienced conversion were young people raised in evangelical homes. An analysis of obituaries in two evangelical papers, the *Christian Guardian* for 1870-3, and the *Canadian Baptist* for 1867-70 shows that most men as well as women were experiencing conversion between age 12 and 29, and that parents played an important role in the conversion of their children.¹¹ Raised in evangelical homes, and encouraged to experience conversion, these young people had been exposed to religious influences since childhood.

Conversion, therefore, was part of a growing awareness of human sinfulness and need for repentance (encouraged by evangelical childhood training), where the individual moved from self-absorption and self-justification to a point where he/she was finally able to rely not on self, but on an acceptance of God's forgiveness through Christ's atonement. It was at this time, that God became, no longer a source of condemnation, but a loving parent to be addressed as *Abba*, or Father, to use a favourite evangelical image. This experience of God as *Abba* was the supreme turning point in the spiritual life, in other words, this was conversion. For many evangelicals, especially Methodists and Baptists, this experience of forgiveness was also accompanied by a warm, often emotional, liberating, even mystical experience, where to use John Wesley's terms, the Spirit of

God witnessed to their spirits that they had entered into a new relationship as God's adopted children.¹²

It is this experience of assurance with its potential for "anti-structural liminality," allowing unconventional and uninhibited behaviour which has figured so prominently in the historical reconstruction of revivalism by feminist historians. However, for evangelicals – and here it is important to draw also on the theology, sermon literature and periodical press – conversion or the new birth was only the beginning of a process of moral regeneration, or change in response to the Spirit. Hence the term "pilgrimage" used by Margaret Hammond is important, for it underscores the continuity and growth which undergirded evangelical piety, where Scripture reading, private prayer, as well as the more public activities of church and prayer meeting attendance, pious conversation, charitable and moral reform activity all played a nurturing role.

The new birth was therefore, literally an entry to a new reality with its own rituals, and its own sacred time which directed the believer to look beyond the difficulties of her present circumstances to an eternity, whose transcendent dimension was already sensibly present in the experience of daily life. Leigh Eric Schmidt, for example, analysing the symbolic significance of the Presbyterian long communion in mid-nineteenth-century America (in which only the converted participated) has pointed out that in such rituals evangelicals experienced not only the bonds of a community set apart in sacred space and time, but also gained a "sense of the continuity of the faith and the generations."¹³

This awareness of the continuity of religious experience is important, for it allows us to draw on the wide range of resources exploring spirituality in the Christian tradition. Including Puritan, but also Reformed, medieval and patristic spirituality, the resources are rich and varied, and helpful in taking greater critical distance from the terminology and imagery used by evangelicals, which as Virginia Lieson Brereton has recently shown in an analysis of women's conversion accounts, was highly formulaic.¹⁴ To get behind the formulaic phrases to the transformative experience which the accounts were intended to describe, much can be learned from current efforts by Roman Catholic writers and others to apply to insights from the social sciences to historical expressions of spirituality.

Informative, for example, in analysing the lives of evangelical young women is the approach taken by a Carmelite, John Welch exploring the spirituality of the sixteenth-century mystic, Teresa of Avila. Combining

Victor Turner's structural analysis with Carl Jung's depth psychology, Welch portrays conversion and union with God as part of the human individuation process whereby a person moves from structure to anti-structure and back again to structure through a series of transitional or liminal experiences expressed in powerful imagery. Such an approach takes the view that conversion is not a sudden event of brief duration, but rather a central event in a human journey of awareness, where thought and activity become directed away from the self and refocused towards God and one's neighbours.¹⁵

While such a resource may seem incongruous given the well-documented anti-Catholicism of nineteenth-century evangelicals, it finds support in the fact that John Wesley who played such an influential role in shaping their spirituality drew on a wide range of sources in the Christian tradition, including such Roman Catholic mystics as Teresa of Avila and John of the Cross. Central, in short, to our methodology in recovering religious experience is the awareness of the continuity of the Christian tradition, and the resulting connections which this permits.

Equally important in the recovery of religious experience is recognizing its communal nature. For evangelicals this included the use of the terms "sister" and "brother" when addressing one another, thereby underscoring the belief that through the new birth the bonds of family had been extended to the wider community. Crucial to reinforcing such bonds were a number of communal gatherings – baptisms, love feasts, long communions, camp meetings – varying with the denominational tradition, and often held out of doors. Here, in a time and space set apart from daily routine and workplace, participants were reminded symbolically of a transcendent reality, separate from yet interpenetrating the every day world. Suggestive in this respect are insights from cultural anthropologists such as Mary Douglas, Victor Turner and Clifford Geertz, exploring the role of symbolic lines and boundaries in bringing order into experience.¹⁶

Equally insightful, and more concrete in the reconstruction of community life which resulted from such ordering are recent studies by historians of gender, such as Deborah Valenze's study of the piety of male and female sectarians in early Victorian England, or the monumental work by Catherine Hall and Leonore Davidoff on the *mores* of middle-class English evangelicals in the first half of the nineteenth century.¹⁷ Though dealing with different socio-economic groups, these works are especially valuable in underscoring the organic nature of evangelical piety, where the

sacred and the secular, the public and the private, this world and the next were inextricably connected.

The implications of such an understanding of reality upon gender formation and the family are most significant and intimately related to socio-economic context. Thus, examining the importance of camp meetings in popular religion, Bruce Dickenson has perceptively noted that while such meetings allowed converts to live in two worlds: “the saints described their new world in the language of evangelical Protestantism, but what they described was distinctly relevant to the place and time in which they lived.”¹⁸ In other words, to recover evangelical religious experience, not only must an awareness of the transcendent be acknowledged, but the question also has to be raised to what extent this perceptibly influenced the way men and women responded to socio-economic change.

My own research in this important but understudied field of investigation is only in its initial stage, and will include a careful correlation of the church and society membership lists of a selected Ontario community (Brantford) with census data and assessment rolls over the period under examination. Based largely on the qualitative sources examined thus far, evidence does suggest, however, that in ways which were different for men and women, for both, evangelical religion was not a catalyst in socio-economic change, as has often been suggested. On the contrary, with its emphasis on continuity and community, it appears to have served as a countervailing force in Ontario against the individualism and fragmentation associated with the commercial and industrial revolutions of the nineteenth century.

In the case of evangelical women, for example, the communal and organic nature of their piety raises grave doubts about the accuracy of the “Cult of True Womanhood” as a relevant cultural construct. Conversion, rather than marking a brief hiatus in the socialization of these women from the values and relationships of an agrarian society into the hegemony of the new commercial and industrial state, may actually have delayed such a development. We need to be even more cautious here about the uncritical adoption of American constructs, for as Marjorie Griffen Cohen has persuasively argued, in Ontario industrialization, with its attendant separation of the home and the workplace influenced the lives of women at a significantly slower pace than in the eastern and mid-western United States.¹⁹ This slower pace of change, it can be argued further, permitted women converts a longer period to maintain the values and folkways of an

earlier agrarian society, values, which, Valenze and others have suggested, were incorporated into the evangelical.²⁰

When finally structural change did begin dramatically to affect Ontario during the final decades of the century, the evangelical voice, as John Grant, William Westfall and others have demonstrated, had moved to a dominant position in culture and society. A socio-economic profile of Ontario's evangelicals is still unavailable, but scattered samples do suggest that by the 1880s in urban centres the movement had become largely identified with the middle class.²¹ Hence in the latter decades of the century, women's moral reform and benevolent societies with their strong support for missions and urban reform are an indication not only of class interest, but also of the enduring vitality of an earlier an organic understanding of reality informed by responsibility towards one's neighbour and community.

For men such a piety where religion permeated all of life, connecting the secular with the sacred, the public with the private, was more problematic. Faced with the demands of life in the secular work place, men were more directly exposed to the encroaching individualism and compartmentalization of the nineteenth-century commercial and industrial revolutions, and thus experienced considerably more difficulty in retaining an organic approach to life than women (or for that matter ministers). Expressing this same observation in somewhat different terms, Clyde Griffen in a survey of the historiography of constructs of nineteenth-century masculinity, has thoughtfully noted that evangelical manhood "still has not received enough attention from historians of masculinity, perhaps because it does not address what seems to us to be peculiarly masculine."²²

In my own research, in what is only a preliminary probe, I have tried to reconstruct some of the contours of evangelical men's religious life through the records of a number of urban men's mutual improvement and benevolent societies between 1850 and 1885. When one correlates the activities of these societies with available information on evangelical child nurture (including the importance of the mother in the socialization of boys), and the dominance of Common Sense philosophy in the curriculum of Ontario's colleges, it becomes clear that evangelical men too were encouraged to take seriously the vision of an organic society. Society records show young men engaged in trying to provide mutual support for one another, sharing with female members a concern to help the poor, bringing young boys into the pale of evangelicalism through Sunday

School activities, and taking an active role in church fundraising.²³ Fragmentary evidence drawn from diaries and biographies further underscores that for some evangelical men at least, whether as, farmers, craftsmen or entrepreneurs, religion had not become privatized and absorbed significant amounts of time and energy.²⁴

The dynamic relationship between religion and class is never simple, and against this must also be set evidence of a contradictory nature. The repeated warnings by clergy against worldliness and obsession with material advancement, male unwillingness to assume responsibilities of leadership in church life, including the assumption of full church membership, all of these suggest that men faced much more difficulty than women in maintaining the ideals of community and continuity which figured so prominently in evangelical piety.

While such a piety did create considerably more tension for men than women, here too the comparatively slower pace of socio-economic change in Ontario must be taken into account, and results in a distinction with the American experience. Not only was there a longer period for evangelicals to consolidate their position in Ontario society, but the growing dominance of the evangelical voice and vision offered men increased opportunities of leadership. Within a patriarchal society, participation in the wide network of voluntary societies enhanced male power and influence as evangelical men attempted to address the onslaught of massive structural change at the turn of the century. Historians have often observed that two significant features of Canadian religious life in the early-twentieth century have been the dominance of the social gospel movement and the unification of three of the country's major evangelical denominations.²⁵ My research stops just short of these two developments, but it should point to their continuity with the earlier transcendent vision of evangelical Christianity. Powerfully expressed in the symbol of the Kingdom of God, and in language of family imagery, this movement confronted the ravages of urbanization and immigration with an earlier concept of organic community, even as it adopted a tone of protest and reform.

Much of this, I realize, is still incomplete, and the final outcome remains therefore elusive. By its nature, what is speculative may, however, also be suggestive—as suggestive for ultramontane Catholics, for example, as for evangelical Protestants, for while much separated the two in the nineteenth century, what they did share was an affinity in their understand-

ing of the organic nature of religion. Given the reality then of the interconnectedness of religious experience and the ordering of life, I can think of no better way to end these remarks than to remind all of us who seek to reconstruct religious life in the past, of the cogent summary of the historian's task recently offered by Mark Carnes in the conclusion of a similar endeavour, *Secret Ritual and Manhood in Victorian America*:

The historian's task is to find out both what happens and why, to link behavior and motivation. He attempts by defective means to stitch the shreds of the past into something resembling the original. Social theory offers patterns, contradictory though they may often be which can guide the historian's hand. But they must never lead it. Social scientists rightly maintain that, without a theoretical template, the historian will fail to find any order whatsoever in the tattered remnants of the record. Conversely, he may arrange them according to his own preconceptions because of its mindlessness: He deceives himself in believing he can leap backward in time into the minds of others. But he has no choice, for all history is essentially a task of imaginative reconstruction.²⁶

To recognize the limitations of our work, to reconstruct imaginatively, without falling into subjectivity and ahistoricism, to be guided, but never governed by social theory, including the insights offered by class and gender, all of this makes our task as historians of religion both complex and challenging. But that is also the reason why we face "Ongoing Questions," not least of which is that transcendent dimension with which imaginatively we continue to grapple – even as by its nature it continues to elude us.

Endnotes

1. See for example: Terrence Murphy, "Religion and Ethnicity in Canadian Historiography," *Studi Enqrazione/Etudes Migrations* 28 (September 1991): 305-318; David Gagan, "Writing the History of Ontario in the 1980s: Defining a Distinctive Society," *Acadiensis* 21, No. 1 (Autumn 1991): 166-179; Michael Gauvreau, "Beyond the Half-Way House: Evangelicalism and the Shaping of English Canadian Culture," *Acadiensis* 20, No. 2 (Spring 1991): 158-177; and Brian Clarke, "Religion, Culture, and Society: Some Recent Studies on Christianity in Canada," *Method and Theory in the Study of Religion* 2, No. 2 (1990): 268-295.
2. Ruth Compton Brouwer, "Transcending the 'unacknowledged quarantine': Putting Religion into Canadian Women's History," Paper presented at the joint session CHA/CSCH, Kingston, 5 June 1991 (forthcoming in *Journal of Canadian Studies*, Fall 1992).
3. Anne Firor Scott, "On Seeing and Not Seeing: A Case of Historical Invisibility," *Journal of American History* 71, No. 1 (June 1984): 7-21.
4. By "evangelical Protestantism" I mean, very briefly, the nineteenth-century transdenominational movement (consisting primarily of Methodists, Baptists, Congregationalists and numbers of Presbyterians and Anglicans), which emphasized the centrality of the experiential doctrines of sin, salvation and a life of service. Often articulating these doctrines against what they perceived to be the sacramentarian and the hierarchical nature of ultra-montane Catholicism, evangelicals nevertheless shared with Roman Catholics the conviction that religion ordered all of life. For this reason my comments may be suggestive either as comparison or contrast for historians of Roman Catholicism.
5. Joan Walloch Scott, *Gender and the Politics of History* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1988), p. 42.
6. For a thoughtful approach to writing female auto/biography see Carolyn G. Heibrun, *Writing A Woman's Life* (New York: Ballentine Books, 1988).
7. Carroll Smith-Rosenberg, *Disorderly Conduct: Visions of Gender in Victorian America* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1985), p. 13. For an early expression of this concept see Barbara Welter, "The Cult of True Womanhood," *American Quarterly* 18 (Summer 1966): 151-174.
8. Scott, *Gender and the Politics of History*, pp. 15-27; Elizabeth Fox-Genovese, "Culture and Consciousness in the Intellectual History of European Women," *Signs* 12, No. 3 (1987): 529-547; Jane Flax, "Post-Modernism and Gender

relations in Feminist Theory,” *Signs* 12, No. 4 (1987): 621-643; and Joy Parr, “Nature and Hierarchy: Reflections on Writing the History of Women and Children,” *Atlantis* 11 (1985): 39-44.

9. Typescript Family History and Testimony of Mrs. Henry Hammond (nee Margaret Boyd) (1790-1861). In possession of the author. I thank J. William Lamb for this source.
10. I have developed this point in “The Double Vision: Evangelical Piety as Derivative and Indigenous in Victorian Canada,” Paper presented at the conference, Evangelicalism in Trans-Atlantic Perspective, Wheaton, Illinois, April 8-11, 1992.
11. In the *Canadian Baptist* 1867-70, of 73 women’s obituaries stating the age of conversion, 73% gave an age between 12 and 29; of 74 men’s obituaries 63%. In the *Christian Guardian* 1870-73, of 166 women’s obituaries 75%; of 104 men’s obituaries 67%. I thank David Zub and Margaret Trapnell for many hours spent analysing the obituaries of evangelicals.
12. See for example the obituaries of Louisa Matilda Maynard, *Canadian Baptist*, 22 July 1869, and of Maria A. Forward, *Christian Guardian*, 16 March 1870.
13. Leigh Eric Schmidt, *Holy Fairs: Scottish Communion and American Revivals in the Early Modern Period* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1989), 102.
14. Virginia Lieson Brereton, *From Sin to Salvation. Stories of Women’s Conversions: 1800 to the Present* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1991), p. 13.
15. John Welch, *Spiritual Pilgrims: Carl Jung and Teresa of Avila* (New York: Paulist Press, 1982), pp. 7-28.
16. Examples of the insights derived from such an approach are Smith-Rosenberg, *Disorderly Conduct*, pp. 129-164; and Gwen Kennedy Neville, *Kinshio and Pilgrimage: Rituals of Reunion in American Protestant Culture* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987).
17. Deborah M. Valenze, *Prophetic Sons and Daughters: Female Preaching and Popular Piety in Industrial England* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1985); and Leonore Davidoff and Catherine Hall, *Family Fortunes: Men and Women of the English Middle Class* (London: Hutchinson, 1987).
18. Bruce D. Dickenson, *And They All Sang Hallelujah: Plain Folk Camp meeting Religion 1800-1845* (Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1974), p. 99.

19. Marjorie Griffin Cohen, *Women's Work Markets and Economic Development in Nineteenth-Century Ontario* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1988), pp. 3-28, 118-158 especially.
20. While Valenze, *Prophetic Sons and Daughters* focuses on English agricultural labourers, a case for the role of evangelical religion in easing the transition from an agrarian to a capitalist society in mid nineteenth-century America can be found in Mary P. Ryan, *Cradle of the Middle Class: The Family in Oneida County New York, 1790-1865* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981).
21. Doris Mary O'Dell, "The Class Character of Church Participants in Late Nineteenth-Century Belleville," (Ph.D. dissertation, Queen's University, 1990). Demographic patterns in Toronto show that by 1899 Methodists had achieved largely middle class status (Peter G. Goheen, *Victorian Toronto 1850-1900* [Chicago: University of Chicago, Department of Geography, 1970], p. 188); for Presbyterians see Douglas F. Campbell, "Presbyterians and the Canadian Church Union: A Study in Social Stratification," *Canadian Society of Presbyterian History Papers* (1991): 1-32.
22. Clyde Griffen, "Reconstructing Masculinity from the Evangelical Revival to the Waning of Progressivism: A Speculative Synthesis," in *Meanings for Manhood: Constructions of Masculinity in Victorian America*, ed. Mark C. Carnes and Clyde Griffen (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990), pp. 188-189.
23. "Young Daniel in Babylon': Young Men's Voluntary Societies and the Reconstruction of Evangelical Manhood in Urban Ontario, 1850-1880," Paper presented to the Gender and Religion Workshop, Emmanuel College, 31 January 1992.
24. See for example, the Diary of William Coates (1865), and the Diary of a Methodist Farmer and Cobbler, Near Picton, 11 August 1869 to 10 November 1877, both in the Archives of Ontario.
25. An extensive survey of the literature on church union and the social gospel in Canada can be found in Phyllis D. Airhart, "Ordering a New Nation and Reordering Protestantism 1867-1914," in *The Canadian Protestant Experience 1760-1990*, ed. George A. Rawlyk (Burlington: Welch Publishing, 1990), pp. 133-138.
26. Mark C. Carnes, *Secret Ritual and Manhood in Victorian America* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1989), pp. 157-158.