Anti-Catholicism among French Canadian Protestants

RICHARD LOUGHEED

Anti-Catholicism

Most historical research on anti-Catholicism has sought a completely hostile indictment, minimizing both the diversity, and the positive aspects of this body of thought. Before Vatican II Catholic counter-propagandists, and even other analysts of anti-Catholicism such as R. Allan Billington[1] and Gustavus Myers[2], were dismissive of their subjects. Recent analyses by E.R. Norman[3] and John Higham[4] have somewhat qualified this one-sided perspective.

J.R. Miller has summarized the various stages of anti-Catholicism on the Canadian scene.[5] While accurate and helpful, his articles limit the phenomenon to English speakers and still leave one wondering about why so many well-educated non-political individuals were attracted to this movement.[6]

Most writers on anti-Catholicism have been either Catholic or secular historians. Protestant historians have felt embarrassed enough about Protestant excesses not to challenge the "politically-correct" assessment. Historical treatments are virtually unanimous in classifying anti-Catholicism as rank ethnic and/or political bigotry which simply uses religious terms for effect. This common starting point has produced a superficial treatment especially of French Protestants.

Higham is rare among historians writing in this field in that he does agree to a distinction between political nativists and those who wanted to evangelize (or proselytize) Catholics.[7] He rejects Billington's oversimp-

lified equation of nativism and anti-Catholicism. Robert Black's survey of French-Canadian mission by Anglicans also describes the religious motivation of anti-Catholicism although he gives political motivations precedence.[8]

Despite common use of the term "anti-Catholicism" in these and other historical books and articles and general agreement as to what this entails, the term has yet to be defined. The following description, which is the guiding principle for this article, could serve as a first step toward defining the term: an ideology, as well as a loosely-allied movement, which propagates the idea that the Roman Catholic church is a ruthless unchanging non-Christian organization intending worldwide socio-political control and elimination of Protestantism.

I maintain, following John Wolffe, that anti-Catholicism was not just a racial prejudice but an integral component of evangelical theology prior to the mid-twentieth century.[9] Besides "the universal human tendency to prejudice and paranoia, the development of militant Ultramontanism, the Irish Catholic diaspora, and a pervasive sense of political and social crisis . . . the crucial factor linking these impulses together was evangelical Christianity."[10]

According to David Bebbington, evangelical Christianity since the eighteenth century has consisted of four essential characteristics. In his summary he lists the "constant defining marks of evangelicals across cultures" such as conversionism, biblicism, crucicentrism and activism.[11] While these same terms also exist in Catholicism, evangelical conflict with Rome increased the gulf until these marks came to be understood as distinctly evangelical. We now turn to examine the manner in which these four marks promoted anti-Catholicism.

In an evangelical context conversionism means that every person, whether Catholic or Protestant, must have a life-changing personal experience of salvation through Jesus Christ. Catholics' repudiation of what they believed to be "proselytism" confirmed to evangelicals the profound error of the religion of Rome.

Biblicism's claims that the Bible is the ultimate authority negated claims of the Pope to be the unchallenged mouthpiece for God. Neither could any person or group be allowed to use civil or religious authority to coerce believers to disobey biblical commands. Yet Catholic countries everywhere persecuted those who followed the Bible.

Crucicentrism rejects any idea of other mediators or of salvation

through good works as inimical to true faith. Prayers to saints, dependence on holy objects, penance and stress on physical observances: all these were seen as biblically unfounded and diversionary from true faith. If so Rome was either heretical or pagan.

Catholics often opposed the leading social causes of evangelical activism such as the abolition of slavery, temperance, opposition to gambling and Lord's Day observance. This opposition provoked evangelical anger about what was perceived as Catholic support of immorality.

Evangelical apologists clashed with deists and liberals. However, during the nineteenth century, evangelicalism's greatest battles proved to be against Catholicism whether in France, England, French Canada, English Canada, the United States or Australia. The causes dearest to Roman Catholics (and High Church Anglicans) were repugnant to evangelicals and vice versa.

The international Evangelical Alliance formed in 1845 largely because of a perceived need to unite against Catholicism.[12] This and other evangelical trans-atlantic networks shared anti-Catholic news and projects.[13] Evangelical anti-Catholicism spread by print, sermons and numerous lectures, both of the intellectual and populist variety.

While anti-Catholicism was a constant evangelical theological tenet throughout pre-Vatican II history, evangelicals rarely dominated political life. The media, politicians and the wider public adopted anti-Catholicism as a cause only at crisis points. In times of pessimism about the ability of a nation to assimilate Irish or other Catholic emigrants, mounting socio-political pressure for governments to curb Catholicism was further fuelled by religious beliefs.[14] Usually politicians and non-evangelical spokesmen then became the anti-Catholic champions. In this broader form of anti-Catholicism political and ethnic motivations and non-religious means came to the fore. This type of political anti-Catholicism has been the focus of almost all historical study of the phenomenon. Yet cooperation of any individual or group of evangelical anti-Catholics with more political anti-Catholics was far from automatic. Contextual and temperamental differences determined the extent of joint efforts.

The *Converted Catholic*, an American evangelistic journal which could be defined as anti-Catholic, with its frequent tirades, in fact, disclaimed the term.[15] It wished to distance itself from political and scandal-oriented spokesmen in order to pursue its goals of addressing Catholics and "converting them to Christ". Evangelism was seen as the

fundamental solution by evangelical anti-Catholics for solving "the Catholic problem" while political actions were simply a means of limiting the damage.

Before proceeding further it is crucial to state that the essence of the evangelical version of anti-Catholicism is neither anti-ethnic nor political. Anti-Catholicism was a defining characteristic of world-wide evangelicalism prior to Vatican II. That is not to say that all anti-Catholicism was theologically based, nor that all evangelicals with these theological principles would agree on the best methods for expressing them. Yet this evangelical anti-Catholicism is the context in which French Protestantism is best understood.

Ultramontane Quebec

Ultramontanism has been studied often, including its Quebec form.[16] My interest lies in examining its approach to religious plurality.

Following the British Conquest of Quebec in 1759, Catholic leaders realized that French-speaking *Canadiens* had to be unified if they were to survive socially and politically in the new English colony. They would have to resist any attempt to split the French language and Catholic religion if either was to survive in the context of a hostile government and substantial privileges for English Protestants. After the divisive rebellions of 1837 and 1838 the bishops moved towards ultramontanist uniformity of belief rather than just French-Canadian unity.

As recruited European priests arrived and French-Canadian clerical candidates increased, the Catholic church was able to branch out[17] and clericalize the vital education and social services as well as to staff all the outlying parishes. The fragile Catholic church which, after the Rebellions possessed little religious fervour, was transformed into a vibrant triumphant church in the mid-1840s.

Priests constituted the focus of village life. Not only were they the guardians of the faith with its sacred mysteries, they were the guardians of the race with its language, culture and traditions, and the mediators between government and people. It became increasingly difficult to survive in a rural or small-town parish if one disagreed with the priest.

Uniformity required close monitoring of any deviance, along with enforcement by socio-religious means. A dissident became the enemy of God, the Church, the French language and the race if he/she questioned

any central aspect of the ultramontane dogma. Freedom of religion was interpreted to mean only the freedom for Catholics to practise and promote their religion. While no violence was to be done, French Protestants and all dissidents had to be marginalized by social and economic means.

As political and religious liberty for the Catholic Church increased, social and religious liberty in the broader French society and in the parish decreased. Dissident French liberals and Protestants were eventually left no room to exist.

Any "proselytism" by Protestants only encouraged the French clergy to reaffirm the necessity of homogeneity of language and faith. The small French Protestant groups were attributed an importance far beyond their small numbers, in constituting a peril for national solidarity. Rabid anti-(French)Protestantism was the rule in episcopal letters and clerical papers in Quebec.[18]

Previous accounts of anti-Catholicism have neglected the prevalence of anti-Protestantism in nations where Catholicism was dominant. This provocation provided an important stimulus to anti-Catholic organization.[19] The theory of a world-wide Catholic conspiracy was given credibility by Vatican pronouncements – declarations on Religious liberty,[20] the Syllabus of Errors (1864), and increased mention of the Index – as well as by stories of persecution of Protestants.

For evangelicals Quebec appeared to prove conclusively much of the Catholic conspiracy theory. Here was a perfect case study of Catholic culture exposed to Protestantism and English freedoms, but powerless to progress due to the total political and social control of its church leaders. Quebec became a *cause celebre* in evangelical journals.

Any verbalized anti-Protestantism by Catholic leaders in Quebec was publicized.[21] Of particular importance were the stories of persecuted French converts from Catholicism which became known around the evangelical world. They told of threats of violence, job loss or censorship: all of these the evangelical community blamed on the priests or bishops.

French Canada also became the prime mission field in North America for evangelical anti-Catholics. Here they aimed to defeat papist ambition and liberate a people. In 1878, Principal William Dawson of McGill, a world-renowned geologist and evangelical, was offered a post at Princeton University but declined saying "the claims of duty tie me to this place where a handful . . . of protestant people are struggling to redeem this province of Quebec from the incubus of ultramontanism and

of medieval ignorance."[22]

An ultramontane society was by definition most repugnant to evangelicals. In reaction to Catholicism's virulent anti-Protestantism combined with its socio-political dominance in Quebec, there naturally developed an equally virulent anti-Catholicism.

Charles Chiniquy

A. The development of an anti-Catholic

Both as the most prominent anti-Catholic internationally in the nineteenth century,[23] and as the only notable French-Canadian Protestant, Charles Chiniquy bears study.

Marcel Trudel's biography of Chiniquy in 1955 described him as an habitual liar, satyr and hate-filled apostate.[24] My study of Chiniquy breaks almost completely with this assessment, finding in Chiniquy a basic integrity, a conversion to Protestantism on a matter of justice, and a genuine evangelical theology. The evidence for such a generous assessment is abundant, but too complex to summarize here.[25]

Chiniquy's conversion took place not in Quebec but in Illinois around 1857. Following his excommunication by the Catholic bishop in 1856, he spent a year denying the validity of this excommunication. Over the next two years he formed a Catholic Christian denomination. Between September 1856 and January 1860, Chiniquy belonged neither to a Roman Catholic nor a Protestant community. In other words the change from Catholic to Protestant came over a period of several years, in the midst of constant confusion as to which side he belonged to, and even several apparent reconciliations with the Roman Catholic authorities.

Paul Laverdure's articles have brought a much more critical eye to Chiniquy studies. He notes the use to this day of Chiniquy writings but focuses his studies on the author as a propagandist for anti-Catholic hate through speeches and literature.[26] I have built on many of Laverdure's ideas and on his research but from a different angle and with quite different conclusions.

The obvious question that arises is why did a loyal Catholic turn to become such a militant anti-Catholic?[27] First, as soon as Chiniquy left the Catholic church, all the clerical weapons were levelled against him. A prominent Vicar General from Quebec diocese was sent to Illinois to gather information on him and to win back Chiniquy's followers. Any unfavour-

able rumours against the apostate tended to be credited by the bishops.

The legends about Chiniquy are quite similar to the propaganda used of all clergy who left the Church since the time of Luther, i.e., sexual predators, egocentric proud violent rebels, immoral followers of the Devil, heretics who spout hate against the Mother Church who had raised them, failures looking for Protestant money.[28] This kind of propaganda in the Quebec newspapers naturally enraged Chiniquy and his followers. In response he typically portrayed the Catholic Church in the worst possible light. He proceeded to develop an evangelical "liberation theology" with both a biblical base, and an understanding of the dynamics amongst those who feel oppressed.[29] Originally he sought liberation only in his local situation.

When Chiniquy returned to Quebec to explain his side of the story, he suffered repeated physical attacks from French Catholics. Catholics were forbidden by their bishops to attend his lectures or read his books and because of his excommunication were to isolate him. French newspapers were pressured if they reported anything positive about him.

As Protestants described the evangelical view of ultramontane Quebec it seemed to fit with Chiniquy's experience. Chiniquy was soon recruited to recount his experiences and the evils of ultramontane Quebec for British and American audiences. As a charismatic speaker, he realized that strong statements and colourful stories were most appreciated. He obliged.

Chiniquy had always been a crusader: first in his immensely successful campaign against alcohol and then against anticlericalism. After his crusade against his Chicago bishop, his next holy war targeted the entire Catholic Church. As always Chiniquy demonized his opponents.

When the dubious tactics of his local bishop (in appropriating property belonging to individual congregations) were supported without question by the Quebec bishops, this drove Chiniquy to believe in the current political conspiracy theory about Catholic leaders. At the same time, Chiniquy was coming to adopt a Protestant theology which the Catholic church had dismissed as heresy. Gradually the excommunicated Chiniquy came to believe that "the more a man is cursed by their tyrannical and idolatrous Church, the more he is blessed by God."[30]

There is the possibility that in a peaceful setting, despite his crusading temperament, Chiniquy might have carried on as local pastor and written about the virtues of Protestantism. It is not so surprising that he

became a belligerent anti-Catholic given the constant legal problems, the circulating of endless scandalous rumours, the presence of a Catholic mission nearby working full-time to combat him, the rebuffs received after he had swallowed his pride enough to present his submissions, the solidarity of episcopal denunciations, the media onslaught in Quebec, the frequent threats and acts of physical violence, and total isolation from all French acquaintances.

B. His themes and his means

Chiniquy belongs to the version of anti-Catholicism which has evangelical roots and evangelical goals. His goals were not ethnocentric nor aimed to conserve anglo power. While the conspiracy mindset he adopted verged on paranoia, Chiniquy truly saw it as his duty to warn all Protestant countries lest they should fall under the social, political and religious control which he had experienced in French Canada. He deemed it disastrous for a free country to allow separate schools or any rights to the Catholic Church.

The ex-priest waded into all the contentious Canadian socio-political issues of the late-nineteenth century. It was difficult for Chiniquy to refute the charge of treason against French Canada. Chiniquy refused to give any political party his loyalty but as a visionary and an organizer he joined the Orange Order, the Civil Rights Association, the Protestant Defence Association, the International Protestant League and the Bible Society. He spoke in defence of Freemasons, the Institut canadien, Joseph Guibord, Alessandro Gavazzi and various other dissenters. Most French Canadians, linked as they were to their church (which had condemned all these associations and individuals) and their language (which was threatened by English Protestant militants), could hardly approve of such positions.

In order for progress, liberty and adequate education to develop Chiniquy believed that political measures were needed to curb Catholic conspiracy. At the same time, evangelism was a necessity to convert those who had been duped into adhering to Catholicism. Chiniquy worked towards the two goals of politics and evangelism with energy and vision. Those who had political priorities such as the *Journal d'Illinois*, the *Chicago Tribune* or the *Huntingdon Gleaner* were quite critical of Chiniquy's lack of political sense or consistency.[31] Chiniquy's lack of political sense can be explained by the fact that his priorities, understanding and consistency were theological.

As Protestant lecture circuits sought out attractive foes of Catholicism, Chiniquy had much to offer. His experiences of social isolation and mob violence as well as his ex-priest status led to a ready Protestant platform outside Quebec. If we examine the list of sermon topics that Chiniquy offered to potential churches or groups, we note a broad range of topics.[32] He regularly preached traditional evangelical, biblical sermons on Sunday mornings and frequently delivered less controversial temperance lectures. Yet wherever he went it was his Sunday evening or midweek lectures on controversial topics which drew much larger crowds.

In this polemical age, Chiniquy thrived and became a Protestant champion. He mastered many of the forms of polemical literature in both French and English. Far more than hate motivated the ex-priest but all his emotions, attractive or not, were vividly expressed by pen or tongue. Like Luther, Chiniquy alternated between abuse, pathos, exaggeration, passionate exhortation and dispassionate logic.

Laverdure has pointed out that the origins of Chiniquy's holy war language lie, in part, in his ultramontane training. The polemical approach of both anti-Catholicism and ultramontanism involved amplifying the polemic, repeating any accusations, adding details and often distorting the original stories.[33] We see this often in the ex-priest. Chiniquy's liberation goals were inflamed by his indignation regarding injustice and his polemical bent. He became furious with Protestant clergy who implied that Catholics were Christians.[34] Chiniquy portrayed Roman Catholicism as simply a persecuting paganism with a Christian facade.

The ex-priest insisted that his was an "anti-Catholicism with love," but the love was addressed exclusively to individual laity and doubting priests who had been "duped" by the diabolical Roman system and their tyrannical bishops.

Chiniquy could provide his audience with inside, if distorted, information about Catholicism. He knew which points were most controversial within Catholicism and he wrote embarrassing public letters to bishops in language Catholics understood. The ex-priest's apparent biblical base and authoritative explanations of Catholic practices were sufficient for Chiniquy to acquire a wide popularity among evangelicals in the late-nineteenth century. He became the interpreter of Catholicism for millions of Protestants.

The ex-priest's language was controlled enough so as not to incite his audience to immediate violence.[35] It was uncontrolled enough to allege

many false motivations and plots, and to spread anti-Catholic legends as facts. Chiniquy's gift of oratory made his tendency to publicise rumours much more dangerous. The ex-priest did not care about appearing tolerant. He used mockery, humour, exaggeration, innuendo and every other means he could think of to shock Catholics into re-thinking their position.

The most shocking of Chiniquy's provocations came in January 1876 when in a Montreal lecture he consecrated a wafer, crumpled it up and ground it under foot. In response Montreal Bishop Bourget recommended to clergy that the Catholic Church celebrate a Mass of Reparation:

> "At the mere mention of this horrible attempt, this unheard of sacrilege, this frightful profanation, there can be but one sentiment of grief throughout the entire Diocese . . . the Lamb of God, full of mercy and sweetness, allows himself to be immolated and held up to mockery by the hands of an apostate and sacrilegious priest, see if there be a sorrow equal to mine (says Jesus)."[36]

This Chiniquy innovation followed the pattern of Old Testament actions against Baal practices, Boniface against the holy oaks, and missionaries against African or Amerind animism. In each case the most central objects of adoration (or idolatry) were physically destroyed, in order to demonstrate that they had no power against the supreme God of the Bible. The Protestant papers did not rejoice in the strong action but neither did they view it as mockery. Evangelicals were willing to defend the action because it had a biblical basis.[37] They noted that the design was first to shock, but then to stimulate reformulation of one's faith.

Inevitably Chiniquy's theology and contacts led him to become less loyal to French Canada. Chiniquy supported any patriotism which contested Catholic power, whether English Canadian, American, British, Australian or that of Bismarck's Germany. He believed that only a strong nation could resist papal interference.

C. His preeminent international position

Charles Chiniquy was the most prominent anti-Catholic world-wide in terms of publications and lectures during his 90 odd years. A study of Chiniquy's contacts in various localities helps reveal his basic tenets.[38] In Quebec, after his adoption of Protestantism, Chiniquy managed to gain the respect of all French Protestants and the personal friendship of their leaders.[39] None of these leaders expressed any public criticism of

Chiniquy. The French Protestant newspapers, the *Semeur canadien* and later *l'Aurore*, were uniformly positive and united behind their champion.

Almost every English evangelical in Quebec stood in support of Chiniquy at some point in time. As for English evangelical papers only the *Montreal Witness*, while very evangelical and anti-Catholic, questioned Chiniquy on occasion about his fund-raising or his extremes in anti-Catholicism. Nevertheless it published virtually all his letters.

The English Quebecer closest to Chiniquy was certainly Principal Donald MacVicar of Presbyterian College. Other prominent supporters in Montreal included Rev. John Campbell, Rev. Henry Wilkes, Principal Dawson of McGill and industrialist John Redpath. All of these men were known as evangelicals committed to French mission. While non-evangelical Bishop Fulford of Montreal opposed Chiniquy and any evangelization among the French,[40] the predominantly evangelical students of the Anglican Montreal Diocesan College turned out in force for Chiniquy's funeral.[41] Outside evangelical circles, only the Orange Order promoted Chiniquy speeches and material.[42]

In the United States and Australia most of Chiniquy's sponsors, publishers and greatest supporters were committed evangelicals. Often the Free Presbyterians took the lead, but in each country Chiniquy acquired broad evangelical support among Presbyterians, Methodists, Congregationalists, Baptists and evangelical Anglicans. Though his tirades against Ritualists must have made many Anglicans fume the sentiments appealed to most evangelical Anglicans.

Similarly in Britain Chiniquy was invited by those who combined impeccable evangelical credentials with staunch anti-Catholicism.[43] The groups they belonged to lobbied Parliament for anti-Catholic measures but far more effort and money was allotted to the evangelization of Catholics.[44] Lord Shaftesbury, the Baptist orator Charles Spurgeon, Lord Roden of Ireland, Rev. Grattan Guinness and other celebrities belonging to the evangelical brand of anti-Catholicism, welcomed Chiniquy. There have been no records found showing comparable plaudits made by any social or political leaders in Britain or elsewhere.

Chiniquy convinced all the leading evangelical leaders in the Western world for 40 years that he was a genuine evangelical. European leaders such as Eugene Reveillaud of France and Alessandro Gavazzi of Italy called Chiniquy a good friend.[45] Either all of these persons lacked discernment, or the fraud thesis in reference to Chiniquy is tenuous. He received

support from evangelicals of all denominations. Probably many questioned his methods, but none seem to have questioned his faith publicly. His supporters, sponsors and publishers were evangelicals. This being the case, he seems to fall squarely in the evangelical anti-Catholic camp.

Influence since Chiniquy

A. Continuity

Chiniquy died in 1899 but ultramontane Quebec held firm until 1960. In late nineteenth-century Quebec, clerical control of French institutions became all-encompassing, embracing schools, hospitals, social clubs and, later, unions. Jobs and educational possibilities were limited to loyal Catholics. Ostracism and boycotts were used effectively to exclude French Protestants.[46] Some converts were taken to court for making anti-Catholic statements or for non-payment of tithes. Freedom of speech about religion was suppressed for the French press and for lecturers through episcopal excommunications or mob attacks.[47]

Growing Catholic dominance towards the latter part of the nineteenth-century permitted enormous pressure to be exerted on dissidents simply through isolation, rather than through overt persecution. As a result, up to 80% of French Protestants left Quebec prior to 1925.[48]

French evangelicals sought progress and liberty for their fellows by means of evangelism and education. Statements by French Protestants and their evangelists never opposed the French language or race. However, their expressions were strongly anti-Catholic. French Protestants agreed wholeheartedly with the English about the dangers of papal authoritarianism, the Index, the Jesuit Estates, separate schools and undue clerical influence in politics.

Chiniquy and anti-Catholic French Protestants force another reading of anti-Catholicism. One could accuse them of being anglophiles who were traitors at heart or one could credit their stance as theologically based and as socially progressive.

As anti-Catholicism became marginalized in the mainline churches, more extreme exponents continued the cause. Canadian crusaders who were most concerned about Catholic dominance, such as Protestant militants T.T. Shields in Ontario, Perry F. Rockwood in the Maritimes and present day Chick Publications in the United States, have all distributed Chiniquy material and other anti-Catholic materials in French.

Once a person had adopted the view that the Catholic episcopacy could easily justify falsehood in a good cause, then any rumour of un-Christian actions by Catholics was likely to be believed. From there it was possible to imagine elaborate conspiracies. Any evidence for one rumour made all the rest credible so that it became impossible to disprove any conspiracy theories. While Roman Catholics have been more prone to accepting accounts of bogus relics, evangelical circles and particularly those with a dispensational theology have had a weakness for believing bizarre stories of anti-Catholic immorality or conspiracy.

Evangelical missionaries around the world have often turned to Chiniquy's writings.[49] His writings include all major European languages, besides being printed in native languages in Russia, India, Formosa, South America and Africa. The lively accounts of the ex-priest's courage and his evangelical doctrine were deemed worthy of translation even in non-Catholic areas. New evangelical converts in any area hostile to evangelical Christianity often related well to Chiniquy. Recent reports to me of people living today who were raised on Chiniquy in Presbyterian Glasgow, German Baptist circles in the United States, rural Haiti and French Africa show the wide impact he has had.

Chiniquy has remained for a century the hero of French Protestants and naturally provided a constant source for anti-Catholicism. His generalizations about immoral priests, conspiracy by bishops and Jesuits and attacks on Protestants were convincing to many. While anti-Catholicism was less public after Chiniquy, lacking such a fearless spokesman, it was the standard position of French Protestants in ultramontane Quebec. Anti-Protestantism bred anti-Catholicism. Evangelical groups in Quebec who faced harassment particularly identified with the Chiniquy accounts. Missionary John Spreeman had been forced out of the Lac St. Jean area[50] before he felt motivated to print *Mes Combats*.[51] Such "persecution" was only to be expected when viewed through Chiniquy's grid.

B. Vatican II

In Quebec, Vatican II combined with the Quiet Revolution to bring massive changes to Quebec society. The new pluralist society has finally provided French Protestants with the opportunity to grow in numbers though they remain around 1% of the French population.[52]

Yet French Protestants often agree with the old Catholic saying:

"Rome never changes." The closed uniform Quebec society has persisted in some rural areas, rejecting Catholics who convert to Protestantism. Many new French Protestants face rejection while almost all face incomprehension from church and family that they have joined a cult group. At the same time an influential segment of media and intellectuals in French Quebec expresses a visceral anti-clericalism. From such a base, new Protestant converts enthusiastic about their new faith and frustrated with their old allegiance are likely to be attracted to anti-Catholicism.

Today those who have responded least to modern pressures and are most sceptical of Vatican II, i.e., those who do not eschew the label "fundamentalist," prize Chiniquy most. Enthusiasm for Chiniquy equally means distrust of Roman reform. It appears difficult for these Protestants to abandon the Chiniquy position that all Roman Catholics are, by definition, pagans.

While in English North America Chiniquy material has become marginal among evangelicals since Vatican II, in French evangelical circles, as in formerly closed Catholic societies of Italy and Spain, Chiniquy is still very popular. Anti-Catholicism continues in pockets of denominations or congregations where it is fanned by older members who have experienced persecution as the norm or where conspiracy theories are popular.

One might speculate about whether Chiniquy would have welcomed Vatican II. Many of the issues over which his battles were fought are no longer problems: auricular confession, limitation on Bible distribution, social control, liberty of religion. Serious theological differences remain between Catholicism and Evangelicalism but the new factors of religious liberty and language of "separated brethren" provide a much more propitious situation for progress.

While mainline Protestant churches participated with Catholics in the Christian Pavilion at Expo 67, the growing French evangelical churches maintained their distance. Nevertheless ecumenical dialogue by mainline churches has facilitated cooperation between the Catholic theological faculty of the Université de Montréal with the evangelical Institut biblique Laval (Mennonite Brethren) and overtures of the same between the Université Laval and the Faculté de Théologie Évangélique (Convention Baptist).

Anti-Catholicism is on the road eventually to becoming marginal even in Quebec. An informal survey of French Protestant book distributors in Montreal found them to have stopped stocking anti-Catholic material

(Chick Publications in particular). That does not mean that they will not take orders when there is a market such as for Rebeccah Brown (the current extremist best-selling author). Anti-Catholic material, in fact, remains the only category in which French evangelical book sales outstrip English sales in Montreal.[53]

Para-church organizations seem to be leading the way in distancing themselves from militant anti-Catholicism. The March for Jesus is a recent international evangelical enterprise. Last year four Catholic parish groups participated in the Montreal march along with 8,000 people from congregations coming from most Christian denominations. Despite protests from some evangelical groups the march went forward.[54] La Direction chrétienne, le Groupe biblique universitaire (IVCF) as well as most Bible Colleges eschew polemics. One para-church organization, the Full Gospel Businessmen's Fellowship, actually facilitates ties between evangelical charismatics and Catholics.

Abandoning anti-Catholicism does not result in abandoning evangelism. All French evangelical groups, which is the vast majority of French Protestants, will continue to evangelize among Protestants and Catholics, whether nominal or not. Evangelism is not equivalent to the normal definition of anti-Catholicism but these have often been treated by historians as synonymous. Though anti-Catholicism and proselytism[55] still exist among French Protestants, these two negative terms should be sharply distinguished from the Christian mandate of evangelism.

Conclusion

While much of anti-Catholicism has political and ethnic roots, the version that held sway among French Protestants and Chiniquy derives from evangelical roots and goals. The experience of Chiniquy and most French Protestants contributed to their interpretation of intolerant ultramontane Quebec as the epitome of Catholic goals. Although evangelicals encouraged political actions to limit Roman power, evangelism constituted the ultimate solution for this evangelical version of anti-Catholicism. Only changed hearts were deemed able to bring justice and peace to Catholic regions.

Chiniquy himself is best understood as an evangelical who became an anti-Catholic rather than as an anti-Catholic who happened to be a Protestant. His circles of influence were all evangelical except for the

Orange Order. This latter group was important in providing the ex-priest with the physical protection he needed in return for his commendations of their work.

Anti-Catholicism has survived longer in Quebec than elsewhere because of the lingering effects of ultramontanism. Although all official anti-Protestantism has disappeared, French evangelicals are still viewed as cult groups by many. Various forms of rejection suffered by current French Protestants serve to give credibility to Chiniquy's thesis of an unchanging intolerant Church. Even the tremendous transformations of the 1960s have had limited effect on anti-Catholicism among French Protestants.

However, a new generation and influential para-church movements are finally reversing the trend. Catholics and evangelicals are beginning to see what they have in common. This process will be accelerated when the excesses of past anti-Protestantism and anti-Catholicism are admitted by all and then, finally, laid to rest.

Endnotes

1. *The Protestant Crusade 1800-1860: A Study of the Origins of American Nativism* (Chicago: Quadrangle, 1964).

2. *History of Bigotry in the United States* (New York: Capricorn, 1960).

3. *Anti-Catholicism in Victorian England* (New York: Barnes and Noble, 1968).

4. *Strangers in the Land: Patterns of American Nativism, 1860-1925* (New York: Atheneum, 1968).

5. "Anti-Catholic Thought in Victorian Canada," *Canadian Historical Review* 66, No. 4 (December 1985): 474-494; "Bigotry in the North Atlantic Triangle: Irish, British and American Influences on Canadian Anti-Catholicism, 1850-1900," *Studies in Religion* 16, No. 3 (1987): 289-301; "Anti-Catholicism in Canada: From the British Conquest to the Great War," in *Creed and Culture: The Place of English-Speaking Catholics in Canadian Society*, eds., Terrence Murphy and Gerald Stortz (Montreal: McGill-Queen's Univ. Press, 1993), 25-48.

6. His latest article and his book, *Equal Rights: The Jesuit Estates Act Controversy* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's Univ. Press, 1979) are more insightful but the latter only considers socio-political motives.

7. *Dictionary of Christianity in America* (Downer's Grove: InterVarsity Press, 1990), 801. Nativism refers to an American nineteenth-century movement which aimed at banning or limiting immigration and the rights of immigrants. This was usually tied into anti-Catholicism because most immigrants who were not Anglo-Saxon (and thus had more difficulty assimilating) were Catholic.

8. "A Crippled Crusade: Anglican Missions to French Canadian Roman Catholics, 1835 to 1868," Th.D. diss., University of Toronto, 1989.

9. See *The Protestant Crusade in Great Britain, 1829-1860* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1991); and "Anti-Catholicism and Evangelical Identity in Britain and the United States 1830-1860," in *Evangelicalism: Comparative Studies of Popular Protestantism in North America, the British Isles and Beyond 1700-1900*, eds. Mark Noll, David Bebbington and George Rawlyk (New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1994), 179-197.

Wolffe, *The Protestant Crusade*, 316.

11. *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: A History from the 1730s to the 1980s* (London: Unwin Hyman, 1989), 3.

12. This was the first successful international cooperation of members of most Protestant churches. Individuals rather than denominations became members. It was a forerunner of both the World Council of Churches and the World Evangelical Fellowship (John Wolffe, "The Evangelical Alliance in the 1840s," in *Voluntary Religion* [Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1986], 333-346).

13. See George Rawlyk and Mark Noll, eds., *Amazing Grace: Evangelicalism in Australia, Britain, Canada and the United States* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's Univ. Press, 1994).

14. Higham, *Strangers in the Land*, 39, 58.

15. *Converted Catholic* 14 (1897), 198. The editor was James O'Connor, an ex-priest.

16. On its ideology see Nadia Eid, *Le clergé et le pouvoir politique au Québec* (Montréal: Hurtubuise HMH, 1976). For a broader view see Jean Hamelin and Nive Voisine, eds., *Les ultramontains canadiens-français* (Montréal, Boréal, 1985).

17. There were five 5 new male religious communities and ten female between 1837 and 1850 according to Bernard Denault ("Sociographie générale des communautés religieuses au Québec 1837-1970," in *Éléments pour une sociologie des communautés religieuses au Québec*, Bernard Denault and

Benoît Lévesque [Montréal: Presses de l'Université de Montréal, 1975], 72).

18. David Thiery Ruddel, *Le protestantisme français au Québec 1840-1919* (Ottawa: National Museums of Canada, 1983), 1-13.

19. In areas of Catholic minorities usually the initial provocation came from anti-Catholicism.

20. Peter Doyle, "Pope Pius IX and Religious Freedom," in *Persecution and Toleration* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1984), 329-341.

21. Ruddel, *Le protestantisme français au Québec 1840-1919*, 1-13.

22. Quoted in Mark Noll, *A History of Christianity in the United States and Canada* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1992), 260.

23. Richard Lougheed, "A Major Stimulant for both Quebec Ultramontanism and World-wide Anti-Catholicism: The Legacy of Chiniquy," *Canadian Society of Presbyterian History Papers* (1994): 36-55.

24. *Chiniquy* (Trois-Rivières:Éditions du Bien Public, 1955). His memoirs (*Mémoires d'un autre siècle*, Montréal: Boréal, 1987) indicate the need to update the account although there appears no revision of the evaluation of Chiniquy's integrity. Yves Roby follows Trudel while omitting the polemics (*Canadian Dictionary of Biography*, 12:189-193).

25. Richard Lougheed, *The Controversial Conversion of Charles Chiniquy*, Ph.D. diss., Université de Montréal, 1993.

26. Note the title of his thesis: "Religious Invective of Charles Chiniquy, anti-Catholic crusader, 1875-1900," M.A. thesis, McGill University, 1984.

27. See Laverdure, "Charles Chiniquy: The Making of an Anti-Catholic Crusader," Canadian Catholic Historical Association *Historical Studies* 54 (1987): 39-56.

28. Compare Heinrich Denifle, *Luther und Luthertum* (Mayence, 1904), and Jerome Bolsec, *Histoire de la vie . . . de Calvin* (Paris, 1577).

29. Chiniquy to P. Moreau, 26 February 1857 (Archives du Séminaire de Québec [ASQ], 52:5f), 41; Chiniquy to Mailloux, 29 July 1857 (ASQ 50:3f).

30. *Montreal Witness*, 29 March 1876, 1.

31. *Journal d'Illinois*, 30 April 1858, 2; *Chicago Press and Tribune*, 2 and 3 December 1858, 2; *Montreal Witness*, 27 April 1875, 1.

32. See Lougheed, "The Controversial Conversion," Appendix 3.

33. Laverdure, "The Making of an Anti-Catholic Crusader," 53.

34. See *A Solemn Question: Can the Protestants conscientiously build up the churches of the Pope?* by Rev. Charles Hodge and Charles Chiniquy (Halifax: Nova Scotia Print Co., 1873); and Chiniquy, *40 Years in the Church of Christ* (Toronto: Revell, 1900), chapter 26.

35. Although many Catholic protestors were arrested, none of Chiniquy's followers were. Nor were there any incidents of violence against Catholic property around his lectures. The significance of this should not be underestimated in a time when Chiniquy was often physically attacked during lectures.

36. The Montreal Catholic paper, *True Witness*, 11 February 1876, 6; also found in *Mandements des évêques de Montréal*, 7:308-310.

37. *Montreal Witness*, 7 February 1876, 2; 18 March 1876, 4; R.F. Burns, *Our Modern Babylon* (Halifax: Nova Scotia Print Co., 1876), 17-18.

38. See Lougheed, "The Controversial Conversion," Appendix I for a preliminary list.

39. E.g., Lafleur, Therrien, Duclos, Amaron, Cyr, Provost, Massicotte, Thomas Dorion, Doudiet, Bourgoin, Villard, Coussirat and the French Anglicans.

40. Black, "A Crippled Crusade," chapter 5.

41. *Gazette*, 20 January 1899, 1.

42. Charles E. Perry, *Lectures on Orangeism and other subjects* (Toronto: William Briggs, 1892). See Lougheed, "The Controversial Conversion," chapter 9 for more on his Orange connections.

43. E.g. the Scottish Reformation Society, the Protestant Educational Institute and the Protestant Alliance.

44. Wolffe, *The Protestant Crusade*, 161-162, 318.

45. Eugène Réveillaud in *Cinquante ans* (Geneva: Librairie J.H. Jeheber, 1902), preface; and a letter by Gavazzi in *Montreal Witness*, 4 April 1870.

46. E.g., Baptist churches in Maskinongé and Sorel. See Theodore Lafleur, *A Semi-Centennial Historical Sketch of the Grande Ligne Mission* (Montréal: D. Bentley, 1885), 82-83.

47. Paul Villard, *Up to the Light: The Story of French Protestantism in Canada* (Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1928), 110-118.

48. Dominique Vogt-Raguy, a researcher from France, in a letter to the author, April 1991.

49. Chiniquy, *40 Years in the Church of Christ*, 415; Trudel, *Chiniquy*, 262-263. I have found twenty-one translated documents in fourteen languages with reports of editions in four other languages.

50. Claude Savoie, "'Les méchants protestants' du Québec," *Magazine MacLean*, 8 (November 1968), 76a-76c; Richard Strout, "Advance through Storm: being the story of French Evangelical Protestantism in Roman Catholic Quebec 1930-1980," unpublished manuscript at Institut Béthel, Lennoxville, 1980, 21-23 (quoted in the Brethren *News of Quebec*, 1946).

51. [John Spreeman] to Joseph Morin, 15 March 1946 (Samuel Lefebvre collection, McGill Archives, c.2/110); *Mes Combats* (Montréal: l'Aurore, 1946) was a French condensation of Chiniquy's autobiographical *50 Years in the Church of Rome* and *40 Years in the Church of Christ*.

52. Allan Swift, "A Church Amid Change," *Faith Today* (January 1991): 19-24.

53. English material outsells in general because it is cheaper and provides more variety.

54. One Montreal innovation is to exclude any identifying banners in order to foster unity in Christ. Any reference to Mary or the Sacred Heart would generate a quick reaction.

55. See Paul Loffler for a helpful definition ("Proselytism," in *Dictionary of the Ecumenical Movement* [Geneva: WCC, 1991], 829-30).