**CSCH President's Address 2012** 

# Church Historical Writing in the English Transatlantic World during the Age of Enlightenment<sup>1</sup>

DARREN W. SCHMIDT The King's University College

My research stemming from doctoral studies is focused on Englishspeaking evangelical use, interpretation, and production of church history in the eighteenth century, during which religious revivals on both sides of the North Atlantic signalled new developments on many fronts. Church history was of vital importance for early evangelicals, in ways similar to earlier generations of Protestants beginning with the Reformation itself. In the eighteenth century nerves were still sensitive from the religious and political intrigues, polemic, and outright violence in the seventeenthcentury British Isles and American colonies; terms such as "Puritan" and "enthusiast" maintained the baggage of suspicion. Presumed to be guilty by association, evangelical leaders were compelled to demonstrate that the perceived "surprising work of God" in their midst had a pedigree: they accordingly construed their experience as part of a long narrative of religious ebb and flow, declension and revival. Time and time again, eighteenth-century evangelicals turned to the pages of the past to vindicate and to validate their religious identity.<sup>2</sup>

Browsing through historiographical studies, one is hard-pressed to find discussion of eighteenth-century church historical writing. There is general scholarly agreement that the Protestant Reformation gave rise to a new historical interest. In answer to Catholic charges of novelty,

Historical Papers 2012: Canadian Society of Church History

Protestants critiqued aspects of medieval Catholicism and sought to show their continuity with early Christianity. They, in turn, were answered by Catholic writers, fuelling further historical debate and study. But characteristically, scholarship on historiographical developments since the sixteenth century falls silent on the religious dimension or assumes its drift into obscurity.<sup>3</sup> Common emphases include the steady waning of sacred historical accounts, and the progressive separation of ecclesiastical from political, or civil, history. Generally speaking, scholars construe this process as having begun in the sixteenth century and having run its course by the end of the seventeenth century.<sup>4</sup>

This historiographical representation remains true specifically in relation to the English-speaking context. In one study concerned with historical writing on the Reformation, the search for an eighteenth-century British perspective chiefly turns not to sources of ecclesiastical history, but rather to the more "secular" historical writings of Enlightenment figures, particularly the triumvirate of Gibbon, Hume, and Robertson.<sup>5</sup> Historiographer Ernst Breisach argues that in England and, by extension, New England, by virtue of the close interweaving of church and state "historians still [wrote] church histories which shied away from a sharp separation of the human and the sacred." But his examples date from the midseventeenth century until only the earliest years of the eighteenth.<sup>6</sup> Other evidence comes from the relative silence of historiographical treatments. For example, Euan Cameron's Interpreting Christian History follows main developments in the church historical discipline along a path laid out almost exclusively by continental European and especially German scholars from the Protestant reformers themselves through to the critical historical scholarship of the nineteenth century.<sup>7</sup> The above studies, alongside others, leave the impression that in the English-speaking context little church historical writing, or at least little of any interest, was being done by the dawn of the eighteenth century.

In recent weeks I have undertaken an attempt to quantify church historical publications in the English North Atlantic region in the period often referred to as a "long eighteenth century." For the purpose of this study, this period is demarcated by two events which profoundly affected this region: the so-called Glorious Revolution of King William and Queen Mary in 1689 that helped to secure a Protestant monarchy, and the year 1815 which brought the conclusion of both the Napoleonic Wars in the European theatre with the British victory at Waterloo and the Treaty of Paris, and the Anglo-American conflict referred to as the War of 1812. My survey consists largely of a review of published titles during this period via the online catalogues of the British Library, the Library of Congress, and the English Short Title Catalogue (ESTC), with search terms my limiting, albeit also limited, guides. I have been aided by the fact that eighteenth-century titles were not only remarkably lengthy by modern-day standards, but also strikingly descriptive or reflective of the perspective to be offered in the work. What I offer here is only an initial foray into the task of organization and analysis. Nonetheless, along the way I have gained the distinct impression that church history maintained a surprisingly solid and consistent presence through decades often presumed to have been the monopoly of more secularized, Enlightenment history-writers. Moreover, church history's presence was not the simple reissue of traditional, time-worn interpretations but rather was creative, varied, and oftentimes profoundly interwoven with the course of events, political as well as ecclesiastical.

# Genres and Themes

Church historical titles published between 1689 and 1815 display a striking degree of diversity in their subject matter. A number of genres can be identified, including studies of particular periods, more comprehensive histories highlighting particular themes, national and universal church histories, and more general national or universal histories which incorporated significant church historical material. Publications also ranged widely in terms of motivating factors and underlying issues. Conveniently, many eighteenth-century titles openly acknowledged a *raison d'être* and/or a perspective – "bias," we would say – to be advanced, such as the defense of a particular notion or, oppositely, a claim to "impartiality." In what follows, I will offer several categorizations with the proviso that these should not be considered tidy or set in stone.

# Martyrologies

One important aspect to a picture of church history's place throughout the eighteenth century is the republication or reworking of sixteenth and seventeenth-century historical works. I cannot explore this angle at length in this paper, but it bears mentioning that one of the most frequent genres was Protestant martyrology. One immediately thinks of John Foxe's Acts and Monuments, or Book of Martyrs. Although the original work was not reprinted intact during the entire period in question, one scholar recently compiled a preliminary list of "Foxe derivatives" – abridgments, selections, and other martyrologies clearly influenced by Foxe – which includes at least fifty titles between the years 1689 and 1815.<sup>8</sup> One example demonstrating the continued relevance of Foxe for editors and readers must suffice. In 1747/48, a Church of England clergyman in London issued a two-volume *Book of Martyrs*, based on an early seventeenth-century compilation drawn from Foxe and other writers but "now rendered into modern English, with considerable Improvements from late Authors." The whole was, in the assured words of the editor, "Heartily Recommended to the Perusal of all those who have a Zeal for God's Glory, and the Prosperity of the Protestant Religion, under the present Happy Government."<sup>9</sup>

Turning to other works produced in the eighteenth century, a handful of martyrologies appeared which relied on a broad range of sources, or which significantly enlarged their scope, so that they cannot be classed as derivative. One version published in the mid-1760s titled The Book of Martyrs, thus evoking Foxe, was nonetheless "abstracted from the best authors, both antient and modern." Subtitled The History of Paganism and Popery, this 440-page volume encapsulated the traditional account covering from the "ten persecutions" under Pagan Rome to the reign of Queen Mary I, but also added highlights of subsequent Catholic threats, real or perceived, including the Spanish Armada, the Gunpowder Plot of 1605, the Fire of London in 1666, and plots on the English throne by "Papists, and their Adherents." Its final section traced what it called "God's Judgments upon Persecutors." The title (long even by eighteenthcentury standards) was tinged with a sense of drama and crisis: "horrid Persecutions and Cruelties," "bloody Massacre," "bloody Inquisition," "detestable Conspiracies."<sup>10</sup> The work underwent at least two re-printings in the next few years.

Another work produced at the same point in time by Henry Southwell, Cambridge scholar and Anglican rector, invites both comparison and contrast with the above source. The title's outline of contents included all events covered by the other work, even "Judgments against Persecutors." Similarly colourful language was used in relation to Catholic "persecutions" from medieval to modern. A reference to its account of the English Reformation and in particular the reigns of Henry VIII and Queen Mary reads like a tabloid subtitle: "wherein are amply displayed all the Butcheries, Barbarities, Tortures, and Cruelties, exercised by the Papists against the Protestants, in the Reigns of that tyrannical King, and bloody Queen." But the work's scope also included a wide array of subject matter beyond the dominion of Rome, pagan or Catholic: early persecutions in Persia and under the Arian Vandals, and, in recent centuries, sufferings experienced by Christians in China, the East Indies, Ethiopia, the Eurasian country of Georgia, and America. It even cast a glance back to pre-Christian times, tracing sufferings of God's chosen people from the Maccabees under the Greeks all the way back to "the first Ages of the World." The resulting effort could claim to be a universal history, appropriately titled a *New Book of Martyrs; or Complete Christian Martyrology*. Despite the title's rhetoric, the volume's chronological and topical breadth suggests more at work than simple anti-Catholicism.<sup>11</sup>

Martyrologies continued to appear into the early nineteenth century. Around century's turn, a Manchester publication hinted at a similar but perhaps more detached perspective. Its (relatively concise) title read: *The Book of Martyrs; or, Christian Martyrology: Containing an Authentic and Historical Account of Many Dreadful Persecutions Against the Church of Christ in Different Parts of the World*... *With Accounts of Very Singular Judgments Against Persecutors, a Variety of Anecdotes, and Many Curious Memoirs. The Whole Forming an Interesting History of Persecutions, Calculated to Promote True Religion*.<sup>12</sup> Noticeably absent is the Protestant "anti-popery" rhetoric. Finally, in the year 1810, English printers produced no less than three martyrologies, one clearly derived from Foxe but the others either drawing from several sources or expanding to a global scope.<sup>13</sup>

# Reformation

Martyrologies might seem an odd cameo appearance in the "age of enlightenment." But as shall be seen, a keen historical interest in the Reformation period persisted. More importantly, a review of titles suggests that issues or disputes stemming from the Reformation and its aftermath remained pressing for English-speaking Protestants.

Multiple and varied accounts of the English and Scottish Reformations emerged during the eighteenth century. One of the most popular was the *History of the Reformation of the Church of England* by Gilbert Burnet, Bishop of Salisbury. Its first two volumes appeared prior to our timeframe, in 1679 and 1681, but the third was published in 1715.<sup>14</sup> The work underwent several further editions, and abridgments also regularly appeared from the early to mid-eighteenth century and again in the early nineteenth. Scholars observe that the work was noticeably more moderate and broad-minded than earlier ones, though still with an underlying concern about the threat to the Church posed "not merely by Romanism and dissent but also by High Church Toryism."<sup>15</sup> A similar perspective was offered by John Strype (1643-1737), who published several works on the subject of the English Reformation between the 1700s and the 1730s.<sup>16</sup> Both Burnet and Strype are commended as history-writers who "prompted genuine factual research and gradually tended to modify religious partisanships."<sup>17</sup>

Moderation, however, was not the only perspective offered to the public. Other histories appear to have been aimed at fanning embers of a more zealous Puritanism and anti-Catholicism. The year 1715, in which Burnet's third volume and a new edition of the whole appeared, also witnessed the publication of A Compendious History of the Rise and Progress of the Reformation of the Church Here in England, from Popish Darkness and Superstition, composed by Daniel Disney.<sup>18</sup> A more substantial and popular work produced during this same season was that of English Presbyterian minister Benjamin Bennet, entitled A Memorial of the Reformation, (Chiefly in England) and of Britain's Deliverances from Popery and Arbitrary-Power, Since that Time, to the Year, 1716... Its central focus was to trace the progress of English Protestantism under Henry VIII, Edward VI, and Elizabeth. But it also offered a longer view through an "account of the apostacy of the church in its rise and progress, till popery was established in the world," and, with more recent perceived threats in mind, "a particular relation of all the plots and conspiracies of papists and others against the reformation, and civil liberties of the land."19

These Reformation memorials together with martyrologies could so directly and potently appeal to (or fuel) anti-Catholic sentiments, indeed serving as monuments themselves for the purpose of reminding readers of their nation's presumably stout Protestant heritage and identity. Fascinatingly, a link is apparent between the publication of such historical works and moments of perceived crisis or insecurity in British history. One of these moments – in the dual sense of a *point in time* imbued with *profound, far-reaching import* – to which the above-mentioned works speak, was the years around the death of Queen Anne and the establishment of the Hanoverian monarchy (1714), quickly followed by a Jacobite uprising in Scotland and England's north (1715) intent on restoring the Catholic Stuart line to the throne. The Oxford *Dictionary of National* 

*Biography* situates the emergence of Bennet's *Memorial* within the context of renewed "fears of a return of the Stuarts." Originally conceived as part of a sermon celebrating the coronation of King George I, it was designed to commemorate past "Deliverances" from "popery" in connection with more recent ones.<sup>20</sup> Perhaps similarly reflecting national unease, Laurence Howel's 1712 *History of the Pontificate: From Its Supposed Beginning, to the End of the Council of Trent* sought to elucidate the "incroachments of the Court of Rome on the Church and State."<sup>21</sup> A second edition was published soon after, in 1716. The title of a martyrology republished towards the end of the decade, *The Good Spirit of the Martyrs Revived*, exuded a sense of crisis or urgency; poignantly, the title page drew attention to this being a second edition, "the first being stifled in King James II's reign."<sup>22</sup>

The latter half of the 1740s stands as another season that brought forth a flourish of similar historical writing. In Great Britain, this was in striking proximity to yet another Jacobite uprising, the so-called "Forty-Five" advancing the royal claim of "Bonnie Prince Charlie," son of James II, finally broken by the Battle of Culloden in Scotland's northwest in April 1746. Significantly, it was Scottish presses that issued forth several histories: a republication of Bennet's work in 1748; in the following year, a two-volume Collection of the Laws in Favours of the Reformation in Scotland covering from 1560 until the present day; and another twovolume work by the Rev. William Crookshank, minister to a Scots congregation in London, focused on "the state and sufferings of the Church of Scotland" precisely during the reigns of the "bonnie" prince's forebears, Charles II and James II.23 Across the Atlantic in Boston and in Connecticut, two seventeenth-century martyrologies were republished in 1747 and 1750, both making explicit reference back to the context of suffering experienced by their original Nonconformist authors.<sup>24</sup> For British American colonists the simmering threat was not the Jacobites but rather Catholic New France. The conflict known as King George's War, fought between 1744 and 1748, paralleled events in Great Britain and appealed to similar Protestant sentiments. Historical works published in these years seem to have reflected a colonial sense of fragility.

An intriguing case is the publication in 1760 of John Lockman's *History of the Cruel Sufferings of the Protestants, and Others, by Popish Persecutions, in Various Countries: Together With a View of the Reformations from the Church of Rome.* The extended title made clear that this was no antiquarian catalogue of sixteenth-century sufferings and

martyrdoms, but was didactic in purpose and prompted by a sense of ongoing struggle with Catholicism: "being intended," it declared, "as a Preservative from Popery and arbitrary Power."<sup>25</sup> Curiously, the author was identified as being "Secretary to the Society of the Free British Fishery." One scholar holds that this organization, founded in 1749, was bound up with British patriotism and the revival of British herring fisheries at the expense of Britain's commercial rivals, the Dutch and the French.<sup>26</sup> Lockman, already a prolific translator of French writings,<sup>27</sup> seems again to have had the French in view; he produced his study directly in the midst of the Seven Years' War and in the year after the British warded off an attempted assault from France on the British Isles. Church history appears to have been enlisted to rally British identity and resolve at a point when the nation's destiny – let alone the success of its fishing industry – was still far from assured.

#### Seventeenth-Century Conflicts

Beyond the Protestant-Catholic divide, eighteenth-century historical writers displayed lively attention to issues stemming from seventeenthcentury conflicts involving Puritans and Presbyterians.<sup>28</sup> Their interest involved, in part, dealing with the course of events themselves, whether in defense or in critique. On one side, a succession of sources sought to uphold the prior century's Puritans and Presbyterians as exemplars, particularly those who were ejected from their churches after the restoration of the monarchy and episcopal church government. In 1702, Edmund Calamy issued an abridgment of the Life and Times of Richard Baxter to which he added accounts of other Nonconformist ministers ejected from their churches in the 1660s, and a defense of their principles and actions.<sup>29</sup> The work was republished in 1713, and in the 1770s and early 1800s reemerged several times under the title, The Nonconformist's Memorial.<sup>30</sup> The works of Daniel Disney and Benjamin Bennet in the 1710s, noted above for their focus on the Reformation in England, both extended their narratives through seventeenth-century Puritanism, thus depicting this line to be, in their minds, the true keeper of the Reformation inheritance. Bennet's work notably included (in reference to Parliament's execution of King Charles I in 1649), as "a distinct answer to the question, who cut off the King's head."31

Scottish writers also produced sympathetic histories of the same period during which Scottish Presbyterian ministers alongside their English Puritan counterparts were deprived of their pulpits and livings. The titles of these works seem to give them near martyrological countenances. First was Church of Scotland minister Robert Wodrow's History of the Sufferings of the Church of Scotland, from the Restauration to the Revolution, published in 1721-22.<sup>32</sup> His effort was abridged in 1725 in Boston by his close correspondent, the prominent Congregationalist minister Cotton Mather, under the more florid title, The Palm-Bearers. A Brief Relation of Patient and Joyful Sufferings; and of Death Gloriously Triumphed Over; in the History of the Persecution Which the Church of Scotland Suffered, from the Year 1660, to the Year 1688.<sup>33</sup> The same theme was then picked up in mid-century by Crookshank's History of the State and Sufferings of the Church of Scotland. This work enjoyed at least four reappearances between 1751 and 1812. Poignantly, Crookshank also later appended this work to his edition of a seventeenth-century martyrology composed by English Puritan Samuel Clarke.<sup>34</sup> A final important example was the work of John Howie whose family heritage lay in the radical Presbyterian tradition of the Scottish Covenanters. That Howie admired this heritage is evident in his collection of the lives of "Scots Worthies" covering from the first Scottish Protestant martyrdom occurring in 1527 until one of the last executions of a Covenanter in 1688.<sup>35</sup>

Countering these works were others that defended and upheld the church-state establishment. In 1730, a work by Bishop of Peterborough White Kennett appeared in defense of the Church of England's "discipline and jurisdiction." It sought to accomplish this first by appealing to what he identified as the English Reformation's "two distinguishing principles" - "the superiority of bishops, and the supremacy of kings" - and then by defending the characters and actions of early seventeenth-century kings and archbishops who had disdained England's clamouring Calvinists.<sup>36</sup> Easily imaginable is the stark interpretive contrast between historical accounts offered by Kennett and his contemporary Benjamin Bennet. In 1810, another Anglican High Church perspective was offered by Christopher Wordsworth, younger brother of poet William, in a six-volume work entitled Ecclesiastical Biography; or Lives of Eminent Men, Connected with the History of Religion in England; from the Commencement of the Reformation to the Revolution.<sup>37</sup> Finally, on the Scottish side in 1815 there emerged a three-volume History of the Church of Scotland, from the Establishment of the Reformation to the Revolution, produced by St. Andrews divine and clergyman George Cook, whose loyalties were firmly with the Church of Scotland's dominant Moderate Party.<sup>38</sup>

# Church and State

Various political uncertainties lingering from the seventeenth century into the eighteenth were contested via church history. A key issue was the relationship of church to state and to monarch. This debate involved not only dissent versus established church, but also Anglican supporters of the Stuart claim to the throne (called the Non-jurors) versus those adamant to see a Protestant succession secured. Illustrating this, it was in the immediate aftermath of the Glorious Revolution that nonjuring clergyman Samuel Grascome turned his attention to annals of the past in order to argue for the continuity of England's Christian inheritance up to what he would have seen as a recent rupture, and also its "historical antecedence and independence" from Roman Catholic jurisdiction. The result was his anonymous publication of the 102-page *Historical Account of the Antiquity and Unity of the Britanick Churches. Continued from the Conversion of These Islands to the Christian Faith, by St. Augustine, to This Present Time ....<sup>39</sup>* 

In the early 1700s, qualms over Scotland's union with England and Wales – enacted in 1707 – prompted several historical examinations. This provided the impetus for Sir James Dalrymple's nationalistic 1705 Collections Concerning the Scottish History, Preceeding the Death of King David the First, in the Year 1153. Wherein the Soveraignity of the Crown and Independency of the Church are Cleared; and an Account Given of the Antiquity and Purity of the Scottish-Brittish Church, and the Novelty of Popery in This Kingdom.<sup>40</sup> Scottish fears were largely ungrounded. However in 1710, three years after the formal creation of Great Britain, a publication clearly celebrating this under the main title Britannia Libera sought to prove not only that Christianity had been established in the British Isles by the apostle Paul and other first-century Christians, but also that "British" Christians – Scots together with the English and Welsh - had early on been "uniform" in their beliefs, order, and episcopal government, and had been consistent in first being "distinct and independent" from Rome and then "ever after vigorously oppos[ing]" its "Tyrannical Usurpations and Anti-Scriptural Innovations." The work concluded with musings on the "probability of restoring episcopacy in North-Britain [read "Scotland"]," and all of the above attempted in a mere sixty-seven pages!41

Finally, the accession to the throne of Hanoverian George I in 1714 caused some unease not only for Stuart loyalists, but also for those unsure

of the relation of English Protestantism to Lutheranism, the religious affiliation of the new monarch who technically was now also Head of the English Church. A title appearing circa 1714 addressed this concern directly: *The History of the Lutheran Church: or, the Religion of Our Present Sovereign King George Agreeable to the Tenets of the Church of England.* It continued, somewhat intriguingly, *Being An Essay to Unite All Good Christians, in Opposition to the Principles of the Church of Rome, John Calvin, and Theodore Beza*,<sup>42</sup> the author perhaps seizing an opportunity offered by circumstances to advocate for the *via media* of the English Church. Again in 1720, an Anglican presbyter translated a Latin work by a London-based Lutheran pastor which in part traced the history of the "Persecutions and Sufferings" experienced by Lutherans in order to support his larger purpose to defend Lutheranism "from the charge of Popery."<sup>43</sup>

#### **Religious Dissent and Toleration**

A survey reveals that historical works also continued debate regarding religious dissent and toleration, especially during the first and last decades of this study's timeframe. Clearly stemming from recent political changes, a flurry of historical works and tracts appeared in the early years of the eighteenth century. The debate can be followed through a series of titles. In 1705, Francis Tallents, an elderly Dissenting minister with the same accommodating spirit as Baxter, produced A Short History of Schism; for the Promoting of Christian Moderation, and the Communion of Saints.44 To this the aforementioned Samuel Grascome offered a rejoinder, in the same year, which castigated Tallents' "scandalous abuse of the primitive fathers, and all ecclesiastical antiquity."45 A feeling of exasperation is reflected in another 1705 title: The History of Faction, Alias Hypocrisy, Alias Moderation, from Its First Rise down to Its Present Toleration in These kingdoms. The work claimed to reveal the nonconformists' "several contrivances to subvert the church and state."<sup>46</sup> Calamy's work on Restoration-era Dissent received two separate published rebuttals in 1704.47 Meanwhile, in Scotland it was the episcopal party that was in the minority, giving rise in 1707 to an anonymous tract attributed to Daniel Defoe, variously titled Historical Account of the Bitter Sufferings, and Melancholly Circumstances of the Episcopal Church in Scotland, or Presbyterian Persecution Examined.<sup>48</sup> These debates, hinging on the interpretation of the religious and political past, continued for at least another decade into the early years of the reign of George I.<sup>49</sup> Even approaching mid-century, a new publication could fan embers into flame. A volume of Daniel Neal's *History of the Puritans or Protestant Non-Conformists, from the Reformation to the Death of Queen Elizabeth*... published in the early 1730s provoked Anglican rector Zachary Grey in 1736 to publish "an impartial examination ... in which," he claimed, "the reflections of that author, upon King James I and King Charles I are proved to be groundless: his misrepresentations of the conduct of the prelates of those times, fully detected: and his numerous mistakes in history, and unfair way of quoting his authorities, exposed to publick view." The critique was sustained through 434 pages.<sup>50</sup>

Again in the years surrounding the turn of the nineteenth century, church historical writing had a role to play as issues of dissent and toleration came to the fore via several avenues. One factor was the numerical growth and revitalization of Protestant Dissent. Similarly, a coming of age of evangelicalism within the established Church amplified the reality that evangelicals often found more in common doctrinally and practically with Dissenters than they did with other Anglicans. In another direction, the emergence of Unitarianism, at times from the ranks of Dissent, raised the ire of orthodox Trinitarian Protestants. A fourth issue was new debate over whether Roman Catholics should be permitted to more fully participate in Britain's civil life, a debate heightened by the passing of the Quebec Act in 1774, Catholic Relief acts in 1778 and 1791, and ensuing Protestant outcries, most notably the riots in Glasgow and London in 1779 and 1780.

An obvious response to tensions is found in William Graham's *Review of Ecclesiastical Establishments in Europe*, published in 1792. Graham, a strong supporter of Scotland's Secession Church living in northern England, rallied English dissent through his purported "candid" historical study of the "advantages and disadvantages, both civil and religious" of established churches.<sup>51</sup> Similarly, two sides to this debate can be seen in the church histories penned by two Anglican evangelicals at the end of the century. Joseph Milner, a settled minister and brother of a Cambridge college president, sought to locate "evangelical" antecedents in early and medieval centuries from the religious margins but also, significantly, from the hierarchical ranks of the institutional church. His Anglican colleague Thomas Haweis, who besides parish work also itinerated in Calvinist Methodist circles and helped to found the interdenominational London Missionary Society, questioned Milner's selection

of high-ranking exemplars and sided instead with a historical succession of those marginalized by authorities.<sup>52</sup> Along similar lines, the publication (or republication) of various "denominational" histories in the decades around the turn of the nineteenth century can be seen as arguments in favour of both the distinctiveness and the validity of these Dissenting churches and sects – for example Quakers, Moravian Brethren, and Baptists.<sup>53</sup>

Somewhat ironically, advocates of Unitarianism in the latter part of the eighteenth century turned to church history for similar reasons. One was the intent to show precedents, in their case for their theological beliefs. Also, as with other marginal groups, Unitarians quickly selfidentified with people from Christianity's past who experienced suffering and scorn. A fascinating case is that of Anthony Robinson, whose ecclesial identity appears rather post-modern: from an Anglican family, he attended Bristol Baptist College, ministered briefly to first a Particular Baptist and then a General Baptist congregation, later embraced Arian and Unitarian beliefs, and finally returned to at least a nominal adherence to the Church of England.<sup>54</sup> In 1793, around the time when his shift towards heterodoxy occurred, Robinson published a 150-page work entitled, provocatively, *A Short History of the Persecution of Christians, by Jews, Heathens, & Christians.*<sup>55</sup>

Finally, debate over greater liberties for Britain's Roman Catholics resulted in historical works advocating a defiantly Protestant perspective. Notably, the publication of martyrologies, many of these derived from Foxe's Book of Martyrs, flourished in the latter eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. Publishing clusters are apparent in the early 1780s and again in the mid-1790s, seemingly coincident with the passing of Catholic relief measures (1778 and 1791) and Protestant reactions.<sup>56</sup> At least two titles from 1813-14 point to continued concern. The first, composed by the English Congregationalist and soon to be Inner Temple lawyer James Baldwin Brown, traced "laws enacted against the Catholics, both in England and Ireland" and sought to "illustrate the views and conduct of the Church of England, the Presbyterians, and Sectarians" essentially British Protestants combined - "with regard to toleration."57 The second, a seemingly less erudite work by a John Gould of Wormwood Street, London, proposed a Historical Account of the Reformation from the Church of Rome, Including the Cruel Sufferings of the Protestants By Question and Answer, to which was subjoined another writer's treatise entitled "The danger of granting Roman Catholic Emancipation."58

# **Broad Church Histories: Thematic**

A number of writers produced chronologically broad church histories in the interest of more particular concerns. Oftentimes the main limiting factor was a particular geography: England, Scotland, or even colonial New England whose short-lived history was situated within a broad sacred canvas.<sup>59</sup> Other authors produced full accounts which traced themes such as Christian mission, episcopal church government, or the corruption of doctrine through the centuries.<sup>60</sup> Continued debate over the status of Protestant Dissent took shape in the form of several chronologically sweeping histories.<sup>61</sup>

Scanning eighteenth-century titles, it is striking how many wideranging church histories were produced by members of somewhat marginalized religious groups. In the 1770s, two histories with comprehensive-sounding titles came from the pens of ministers within the Scottish Secession Church.<sup>62</sup> In 1781, John Wesley published a fourvolume Concise Ecclesiastical History, from the Birth of Christ, to the Beginning of the Present Century. This work was an abridgment derived from the learned Ecclesiastical History by German Lutheran scholar Johann Lorenz von Mosheim, but Wesley included at the end of the final volume his "Short history of the people called Methodists."<sup>63</sup> Wesley was only one of several evangelical clergymen on both sides of the Atlantic including prominent leaders such as Jonathan Edwards and John Newton as well as the above-mentioned Milner and Haweis - who produced histories manifestly for the purpose of tracing a pedigree for evangelical characteristics and the experience of religious revival, and of demonstrating evangelicals' continuity with other "godly" Christians who endured suffering and scorn. This type of church historical writing served the pragmatic purpose of rendering legitimacy to the beliefs and practices of marginalized Protestants or, at minimum, finding comfort in historical good company.

## **Broad Church Histories: Comprehensive**

A handful of works sought to represent historical Christianity in its fullest sense, temporally, geographically, and without an obvious interpretive filter (not to suggest, however, that this was not present). Of these, by far the most substantial and popular was the multi-volume translation of Mosheim's history, produced by Scottish clergyman Archibald Maclaine and published in 1755 under the title, An Ecclesiastical History, Antient and Modern, From the Birth of Christ, To the Beginning of the Present Century.<sup>64</sup> One finds at least ten republications on both sides of the North Atlantic up to 1812, as well as numerous abridgments. Euan Cameron suggests it was in the English-speaking context that Mosheim's work achieved its greatest popularity, via Maclaine.<sup>65</sup> It would have been difficult for a critic to challenge, or for another writer to outdo, Mosheim's thoroughness. Century by century, Mosheim detailed the church's relation to learning and philosophy, its leadership, government, doctrine, rites and ceremonies, sects and heresies, all of which he characterized as Christianity's internal history, as well as external events which he saw positively or negatively affecting the church. In the English context, besides Wesley and other religious figures, Edward Gibbon made use of Mosheim's work and recommended it within the pages of his History of the Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire (though observing the author's relative partisanship on the subject of the Reformation).66

#### **Broad Church Histories: Universal**

Lastly, within this category, my historiographical enquiry brings to light sources that speak to the continued utility of religious historical paradigms. Typically these imposed a theological framework on history and/or expanded "church history" beyond its normal timeframe into a more universal "sacred" narrative. In 1713, an English translation of the multi-volume work of French scholar Louis Ellies Du Pin appeared under the title A Compendious History of the Church, from the Beginning of the World to this Present Time . . .<sup>67</sup> A somewhat surprising find is A True Ecclesiastical History, from Moses, to the Time of Martin Luther, in Verse ... (1722), an English translation of the Latin original first published in 1688 as the posthumous work of none other than famed political theorist and philosopher Thomas Hobbes.<sup>68</sup> The History of the Church under the Old Testament which Church of Scotland minister Robert Millar published in 1730 could be paired with his earlier History of the Propagation of Christianity, and Overthrow of Paganism . . . to constitute a complete chronological account from creation to his own day, further linked by a consistent interest in the vanguard of God's people and redemptive plan.<sup>69</sup> Finally, in 1812, John Sabine produced in London A Chronology of Sacred and Ecclesiastical History, from the Creation of the World to the Present

# Period.<sup>70</sup>

Other works more explicitly represented church history within a sacred or cosmic drama. One such example was The History of the Work of Redemption by New England evangelical Jonathan Edwards. First communicated as a lengthy sermon series in 1739, the work came into the view of a transatlantic audience decades later through publication in London in 1774. Despite being scorned by one British critic as the product of "the most unbridled imagination" or of an "intoxicated visionary presuming to see the will of God,"71 the volume underwent republication twelve more times prior to 1815.<sup>72</sup> Another seemingly popular work was The General History of the Christian Church, from Her Birth to Her Final Triumphant State in Heaven, Chiefly Deduced from the Apocalypse of St. John the Apostle, first published in 1771 under a pseudonym. Likely to raise modern eyebrows, nonetheless the book was the product of an Irish bishop, Charles Walmesley, and by 1812 it was at its fifth edition.<sup>73</sup> And in 1811, there appeared A Christian's Survey of All the Primary Events and Periods of the World; from the Commencement of History, to the Conclusion of Prophecy.<sup>74</sup> Its author, Granville Penn, was from an aristocratic heritage, studied at Cambridge, worked in the English government's war department, and went on later to publish a variety of scholarly works.<sup>75</sup> His prophetic survey of world history underwent a second edition in 1812, and two years later issued from a press in Virginia.

#### National and Universal Histories

A final important feature emerging from my survey that I will only briefly summarize here is the firm place that religious aspects held in more general historical works. The turn-of-the-eighteenth-century title *The General History of England, both Ecclesiastical and Civil*<sup>76</sup> illustrates a standard dual-lens approach which one finds throughout the period in other histories of England, Scotland, Ireland, New England, continental European nations, and even global histories. An interesting pattern is an apparent shift in the prioritizing of these two angles: beyond the 1760s or 1770s, titles tended to reverse the order to "civil" followed by "ecclesiastical."<sup>77</sup> But the point stands that religion remained of vital importance in representations of history. Even the *Encyclopædia Britannica*, first appearing in 1771, stated its intent to represent human knowledge, historical and contemporary, of the material world as well as of "Matters Ecclesiastical, Civil, Military, Commercial, &c."<sup>78</sup> One final example in this genre gave a spiritual backdrop to a national history: Benjamin Trumbull's 1810 *General History of the United States of America* was subtitled "Sketches of the divine agency, in their settlement, growth, and protection; and especially in the late memorable revolution."<sup>79</sup>

#### Features

This review of church history-writing in the long eighteenth century has been sweeping and necessarily speculative. However, distinct impressions emerge from the broad canvas. A number of these, I would venture, work against the assumptions or generalizations that historiographers (and historians who read them) have made.

An initial observation to make is the perhaps surprising presence of historical works with religious themes within this time period. A rough and undoubtedly incomplete tally of publications dealing primarily with church history approaches three hundred.<sup>80</sup> Of course, claims for church history's presence or vitality in the context of eighteenth-century publications should avoid being lofty. Several hundred publications constitute a very small percentage in relation to the total history-related output of printers; but, conversely, several hundred publications have been almost entirely overlooked by scholars, including those focusing on historiography or on religious aspects. Similarly, there is no clear indication that church historical writing waned over the course of the century, and we have identified several seasons when attention to Christianity's history flourished. Moreover, "ecclesiastical history" maintained its pairing with "civil" though typically shifting from a primary to a secondary place.

This survey also raises qualifications on how one might view the role of religion in the English-speaking North Atlantic world moving from the seventeenth into the eighteenth century. A typical construal traces turmoil stemming from the Reformation through the seventeenth-century intrigues and tumult of Puritan-royalist controversies, and culminating in the Glorious Revolution which brought both a Protestant monarchy and toleration for dissenters in 1689-90. Accounts along these lines give the impression that religious (and political) controversies were largely settled by the end of the seventeenth century.<sup>81</sup>

I can see at least two facets rising from my survey that serve to nuance this standard narrative. First, church historical writing shows us that quarrels emanating from the Reformation were not tidily resolved with the Glorious Revolution. Rather, well into the next century the contentious issues of the prior so-called "age of controversy" remained alive: fears of a Roman Catholic ascendancy, Puritanism, the nature of relationships between church and state or established church and dissent, and so forth. Perhaps the historical debate became generally less intense or vehement. But any apparent shift in civility seems to have been one of degree rather than kind.

A second facet is a sustained connection between church history and key moments in politics and society, such as transitions in the British monarchy; the vicissitudes of ensuring a Protestant succession; Jacobite uprisings; successive conflicts with France; the American Revolution; and Catholic emancipation in Great Britain.82 That writers and readers turned to the pages of Christianity's past at these times should stand as a clear indication that religion continued to factor in people's perceptions of what we would view to be largely matters of state. Recent scholarship has worked to highlight Protestantism's place in the cultivation of British identities.<sup>83</sup> What seems lacking is attentiveness to the role of religious history-writing as an important part of this process.<sup>84</sup> Besides the abovenamed events and issues, is it possible that other defining moments were charged with religious significance in part through the work of writers of church history? Might this have been true, for example, of the 1810s, during which Britain finally defeated Napoleon and rapidly began to build up their overseas empire and influence, and during which the fledgling United States of America concluded another war with the British and pushed west in pursuit of what would in later decades come to be known as Manifest Destiny? During a time such as this, reference to the religious past potentially could lend weight to the significance of these developments, amplifying a sense of "moment." The possibility would indeed seem especially potent with historical accounts that moved beyond straightforward historical narratives into universal or even cosmic accounts imbued with sacred meaning. The appearance of several works of this nature in the early 1810s is intriguing at the least.

Such speculation aside, the suggestion or implication by historiographers that sacred historical perspectives dwindled away in early modern times does not suffice for the English-speaking context. Though the overall trajectory assuredly was one of recession, clear signs exist that writers as well as readers continued to situate church history and even "secular" human affairs within a religious framework. Interestingly, the sacred chronologies and histories interpreted via prophecy which emerged in latter decades generally came from the pens of established clergy and educated churchmen, not radical interpreters. A similar revision appears necessary in relation to those who would characterize an ever-widening breach between religious and political, or ecclesiastical and civil, historical writing. Again, this rendering generally rings true, but less so in the English-speaking context.

I hope this study offers a reminder that we, as scholars interested in the history of Christianity, are never short of further fields of enquiry. Somewhat due to the prevailing historiographical narrative I have found reason to qualify, we continue to need to build a case for the relevance of church history, the importance of religious considerations towards properly understanding the past in a wide variety of spheres. So, to quote the venerable C.S. Lewis, "further up" and "further in"!

#### Endnotes

- I am grateful for the vigorous yet collegial character of the Canadian Society of Church History's annual meeting, and also for the specific comments and questions which I received in regard to this paper. I would also like to express my thanks to The King's University College in Edmonton for providing support and a "home base" for my research work in the last two years, by way of a Visiting Research Fellowship.
- 2. Darren Schmidt, "Reviving the Past: Eighteenth-Century Evangelical Interpretations of Church History" (Ph.D. diss., University of St. Andrews, 2009).
- 3. Prominent historiographer Donald Kelley draws at least brief attention to ecclesiastical historians' sustained role in seeking to explain the past in religious (rather than simply in political) terms. In Kelley's reckoning, their efforts "informed historical narrative down to Ranke" in the nineteenth century. See Donald R. Kelley, ed., Versions of History from Antiquity to the Enlightenment (New Haven & London: Yale University Press, 1991), 10. This statement notwithstanding, Kelley's construal reflects the prevailing scholarly notion of ecclesiastical history's steady decline commensurate with the rise of more "secular" and predominantly political histories. His selection of primary excerpts on historical writing (314-69) includes sixteenth-century Protestant writers from Luther to John Foxe and then moves on to sixteenthand seventeenth-century political and "national" histories. His later observation (425) that Jacques-Benigne Bossuet's Discourse on Universal History of 1681 "rehears[ed] the old providential plan of human history" solidifies an overall impression that religious approaches to history were largely passé by the end of the seventeenth century.

- See, for example, Ernst Breisach, *Historiography: Ancient, Medieval, & Modern*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Chicago & London: University of Chicago Press, 1994), 167, 177, 180; and A.G. Dickens and John M. Tonkin with Kenneth Powell, *The Reformation in Historical Thought* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1985), 103, 112-14.
- 5. Dickens and Tonkin, Reformation in Historical Thought, 119-49.
- 6. Breisach, *Historiography*, 180; he reaffirms that political stability in England brought less historiographical change than in France and Germany (200). Some examples given include Bishop Gilbert Burnet on the English Reformation, William Bradford's *History of Plymouth Plantation* (1646), and Cotton Mather's *Magnalia Christi Americana* (1702).
- 7. Euan Cameron, Interpreting Christian History: The Challenge of the Churches' Past (Malden, MA & Oxford: Blackwell, 2005), 122-57.
- Eirwen Nicholson, "Eighteenth-Century Foxe: Evidence for the Impact of the Acts and Monuments in the 'Long' Eighteenth Century," in John Foxe and the English Reformation, ed. David Loades (Aldershot, UK: Scolar Press, 1997), 143-77, at 172-76.
- John Foxe, The Book of Martyrs: or, the History of the Church, from the Beginning of Christianity, to the Conclusion of the Reign of Q. Mary I..., 2 vols. (1747-1748). Note: throughout this paper, the absence of a place of publication can be taken to mean that the work was published in London.
- The Book of Martyrs: or, the History of Paganism and Popery . . . , 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Coventry, 1764).
- 11. Henry Southwell (1729/30-1779), *The New Book of Martyrs; or Complete Christian Martyrology* . . . ([1765]; republished circa 1785).
- 12. Foxe, *The Book of Martyrs; or, Christian Martyrology* . . . (Manchester, [1800]).
- 13. Foxe, The Book of Martyrs, or Christian Martyrology: Containing an Authentic and Historical Relation of Many Dreadful Persecutions against the Church of Christ (Liverpool, 1810); Henry Moore, The History of the Persecutions of the Church of Rome; and Complete Protestant Martyrology ..., 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (1810); and Ezekiel Blomfield, The History of the Martyrs; or an Authentic Narration of the Sufferings of the Church of Christ, in Every Part of the World, from the Age of the Apostles to the Present Time ..., 2 vols. (Bungay [Suffolk], 1810).
- 14. Gilbert Burnet, *History of the Reformation of the Church of England* ..., 3 vols. (1679/1681/1715).

- 15. Dickens and Tonkin, Reformation in Historical Thought, 107-8.
- 16. John Strype, Ecclesiastical Memorials Relating to the Reformation of Religion and the Emergencies of the Church of England, under King Henry VIII. King Edward VI. and Queen Mary... (London [?], ca. 1717; republished 1721 and 1733); and Strype, Annals of the Reformation and Establishment of Religion ... (1709, republished 1725, 1735, 1737, 1738, and 1778; the first two editions focused only on the first twelve years of Elizabeth's reign, whereas later editions extended to the accession to the throne of James I). Dickens and Tonkin describe Strype as "a Low Churchman and a Whig" who, in good Anglican fashion, "detested Puritanism as much as Romanism." See Reformation in Historical Thought, 106.
- 17. Dickens and Tonkin, Reformation in Historical Thought, 101.
- 18. Daniel Disney, A Compendious History of the Rise and Progress of the Reformation of the Church Here in England ... (1715). A similar work from a few years later is Henry Bilton, The History of the English Martyrs, Who Suffer'd Death for Opposing the Romish Religion, from the Reign of King Henry the IVth, 1400, to the End of the Reign of Queen Mary the 1st, who Dy'd 1558... (1720).
- 19. Benjamin Bennet, A Memorial of the Reformation ... (1717).
- David L. Wykes, "Bennet, Benjamin (c.1674-1726)," in Oxford Dictionary of National Biography (hereafter DNB), doi:10.1093/ref:odnb/2100 (accessed 16 May 2012).
- 21. Laurence Howel, The History of the Pontificate ... (1712).
- 22. The Good Spirit of the Martyrs Revived: Being a Collection of the Most Remarkable Passages and Living Testimonies of the True Church of God, and Her Faithful Martyrs in All the Ages of the World ..., 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (1718).
- 23. Benjamin Bennet, Memorial of the Reformation ... (Edinburgh, 1748); A Collection of the Laws in Favours of the Reformation in Scotland ... (Edinburgh, 1749); William Crookshank, The History of the State and Sufferings of the Church of Scotland, from the Restoration to the Revolution ..., 2 vols. (1749). It was also in these years that the earlier-mentioned two-volume abridgment of Foxe was published in London (1747-48) (see n. 8).
- 24. Thomas Mall, History of the Martyrs Epitomised. A Cloud of Witnesses; or, the Sufferers Mirrour, Made Up of the Swanlike Songs, and Other Choice Passages of a Great Number of Martyrs and Confessors, to the End of the Sixteenth Century ..., 2 vols. (Boston, 1747); and Ellis Hookes, The Spirit of the Martyrs Revived, in a Brief Compendious Collection of the Most

Remarkable Passages, and Living Testimonies of the True Church, Seed of God, and Faithful Martyrs in All Ages . . . ([New London (?)], CT, 1750).

- 25. John Lockman, A History of the Cruel Sufferings of the Protestants, and Others, by Popish Persecutions, in Various Countries . . . (1760, republished in Dublin, 1763). The work's material was presented by way of "Question and Answer" so as to be useful especially in schools but also for "all Protestant Families." Lockman also compiled histories of England and of Rome in a similar format.
- 26. Bob Harris, "Patriotic Commerce and National Revival: The Free British Fishery Society and British Politics, c.1749-58," *English Historical Review* 114, no. 456 (1999): 285-313.
- According to the *DNB*, in earlier decades Lockman had published volume after volume translated from French writers, including Voltaire (with "copious anti-Roman Catholic notes"), Pierre Bayle's Enlightenment classic *Dictionnaire*, and a three-volume set of French travel writings. James Sambrook, "Lockman, John (1698-1771)," *DNB*, doi:10.1093/ref:odnb/16912 (accessed 16 May 2012).
- 28. Dickens and Tonkin, Reformation in Historical Thought, 100.
- 29. Edmund Calamy, An Abridgment of Mr. Baxter's History of His Life and Times. With an Account of Many Others of Those Worthy Ministers Who were Ejected, After the Restauration of King Charles the Second . . . And a Continuation of Their History, Till the Year 1691... (1702). In 1718, Calamy published a letter challenging the presentation of seventeenth-century Puritanism by Laurence Echard's History of England (volumes 2 and 3 of which were published in 1718). Echard, Archdeacon of Stowe, was also author of A General Ecclesiastical History from the Nativity of Our Blessed Saviour to the First Establishment of Christianity (1702).
- 30. Edmund Calamy, The Nonconformist's Memorial: Being an Account of the Ministers, Who were Ejected or Silenced after the Restoration ..., 2 vols., ed. Samuel Palmer (1775). According to the ESTC, this work was republished in 1777 and 1778. The British Library's main catalogue includes a threevolume second edition published in 1802-1803.
- 31. Disney, Compendious History (1715); and Bennet, Memorial of the Reformation (1717).
- 32. Robert Wodrow (1679-1734), *The History of the Sufferings of the Church of Scotland* ..., 2 vols. (Edinburgh, 1721-22).
- 33. Cotton Mather, The Palm-Bearers ... (Boston, 1725).

- 34. Crookshank, History of the State and Sufferings of the Church of Scotland. .. (1749), republished in 1751 (Edinburgh), 1787 (Glasgow), and 1812 (n.p.); and Samuel Clarke, A General Martyrology, Containing a Collection of All the Greatest Persecutions Which Have Befallen the Church of Christ, from the Creation, to Our Present Times ... To Which is Added, the State and Sufferings of the Church of Scotland, from the Restoration, to the Revolution ... By William Crookshank, A.M. ... (Glasgow, 1770).
- 35. John Howie (1735-1793), Biographia Scoticana: Or a Brief Historical Account of the Lives, Characters, and Memorable Transactions of the Most Eminent Scots Worthies, Noblemen, Gentlemen, Ministers, and Others: From Mr Patrick Hamilton, Who Was Born About the Year of Our Lord 1503. and Suffered Martyrdom at St Andrews, Feb. 1527. to Mr James Renwick, Who Was Executed in the Grass-Market of Edinburgh, Feb. 17. 1688 . . . (Glasgow, 1775). See also his Faithful Contendings Displayed: Being an Historical Relation of the State and Actings of the Suffering Remnant in the Church of Scotland, . . . from the Year 1681 to 1691 . . . (Glasgow, 1780). For biographical details on Howie, see Alexander Du Toit, "Howie, John (1735-1793)," DNB, doi:10.1093/ref:odnb/13992 (accessed 25 May 2012).
- 36. White Kennett, An Historical Account of the Discipline and Jurisdiction of the Church of England, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (1730). Seventeenth-century figures included James I and Charles I and their Canterbury archbishops Richard Bancroft and William Laud.
- Christopher Wordsworth, *Ecclesiastical Biography*..., 6 vols. (1810). According to the *DNB*, at the time of publication Wordsworth was a dean and rector in Bocking, Essex, as well as domestic chaplain to the Archbishop of Canterbury. Richard Sharp, "Wordsworth, Christopher (1774-1846)," *DNB*, doi:10.1093/ref:odnb/29970 (accessed 25 May 2012).
- George Cook, The History of the Church of Scotland, from the Establishment of the Reformation to the Revolution . . . , 3 vols. (Edinburgh, 1815). On Cook, see T. F. Henderson, "Cook, George (1772-1845)," rev. Stewart J. Brown, DNB, doi:10.1093/ref:odnb/6137 (accessed 25 May 2012).
- Samuel Grascome, An Historical Account of the Antiquity and Unity of the Britanick Churches . . . (1692). The above quotation is from D. A. Brunton, "Grascome, Samuel (1641-1708)," DNB, doi:10.1093/ref:odnb/11302 (accessed 18 May 2012).
- Sir James Dalrymple, Collections Concerning the Scottish History, Preceeding the Death of King David the First, in the Year 1153... (Edinburgh, 1705); and David Allan, "Dalrymple, Sir James, of Borthwick, first baronet (1650-1719)," DNB, doi:10.1093/ref:odnb/7051 (accessed 18 May 2012).

According to Allan, Dalrymple specifically was reacting to an English author's provocative claim that the Scottish church historically fell within the jurisdiction of the archdiocese of York. Dalrymple added an appendix of original church charters and other documentary evidence, for good measure.

- 41. Ninian Wallis, Britannia Libera. A True Narrative of the Antiquity, Independency, Purity, and Uniformity of the British Churches . . . (Dublin, 1710).
- 42. The History of the Lutheran Church . . . By a Gentleman-Commoner of Magdalen-College in Oxford (1714 [?]).
- 43. Balthasar Mentzer, A Vindication of the Lutheran Religion, from the Charge of Popery, in Several Letters to a Friend. Wherein the Lutheran Principles are Fully Explain'd and Confirm'd, Several Vulgar Errors and Prejudices Concerning Them Corrected; and a Large Historical Account Given of their Persecutions and Sufferings ... (1720).
- 44. Francis Tallents, A Short History of Schism ... (1705). A biographer observes Tallents' occasional attendance after 1662 at Church of England worship – in fact at the Shrewsbury church in which he previously ministered – and his inscription on the wall of a Dissenting meeting-house established in 1691 that the building was intended "not for a faction or a party, but for promoting repentance and faith, in communion with all that love our Lord Jesus Christ, in sincerity." See C.D. Gilbert, "Tallents, Francis (1619-1708)," DNB, doi:10.1093/ref:odnb/26953 (accessed 18 May 2012).
- 45. Samuel Grascome, Moderation in Fashion: or, An Answer to a Treatise, Written by Mr. Francis Tallents, Entituled, A Short History of Schism . . . (1705). The written debate between these two writers continued at least two more years: see Grascome, Schism Triumphant: or, a Rejoinder to a reply of Mr. Tallents, Entituled, Some Considerations on Mr. S. G's Large Answer to his Short History of Schism . . . (1707).
- 46. *The History of Faction* . . . (1705). This work, published anonymously, usually is attributed to Sackville Tufton.
- 47. Isaac Sharpe, Animadversions on Some Passages of Mr. Edmund Calamy's Abridgment of Mr. Richard Baxter's History of His Life and Times... (1704); followed by his Animadversions on Other Passages of Mr. Edmund Calamy's Abridgment of Mr. Richard Baxter's History of His Life and Times. Part II.
  ... (1704). In the first publication, Sharpe worked to demonstrate the "affection" that Richard Baxter and his compatriots held towards "the Establishment in Church and State."

- 48. [Daniel Defoe], An Historical Account of the Bitter Sufferings, and Melancholly Circumstances of the Episcopal Church in Scotland, Under the Barbarous Usage and Bloody Persecution of the Presbyterian Church Government . . . (Edinburgh, 1707), according to the ESTC also published twice more the same year in Edinburgh under the title Presbyterian Persecution Examined . . . , once in octavo and once in quarto.
- 49. See, as illustrations: The Moderation and Loyalty of the Dissenters, Exemplify'd from the Historians, and Other Writers of Their Own Party, as well as from Their Late Proceedings ... (1710); [Richard Burridge], The History of the Rise and Growth of Schism in Europe, to the Great Scandal of the Christian Religion ... (1714); and The Church of England Man's Memorial; or, the History of Comprehension and Toleration. Wherein is Fully Prov'd, that the Admission of Sectaries into the State, Must Inevitably Terminate in the Destruction of the Establish'd Church ... (1718).
- 50. Daniel Neal, History of the Puritans or Protestant Non-Conformists, from the Reformation to the Death of Queen Elizabeth . . . , 4 vols. (1732-1738); Zachary Grey, An Impartial Examination of the Second Volume of Mr. Daniel Neal's History of the Puritans . . . (1736). Grey followed this in 1744 with a further 82-page Review of Mr. Daniel Neal's History of the Puritans . . . (Cambridge).
- 51. William Graham, A Review of Ecclesiastical Establishments in Europe ... (Glasgow, 1792); a second edition was published in London in 1796. On Graham, see Kenneth B. E. Roxburgh, "Graham, William (1737-1801)," DNB, doi:10.1093/ref:odnb/11226 (accessed 18 May 2012).
- 52. Joseph Milner, *History of the Church of Christ...*, 3 vols. (Cambridge, 1794, 1795 and 1797); a fourth volume which took the narrative to the Reformation was published posthumously in two parts in 1803 and 1809, edited by Milner's brother Isaac; and Thomas Haweis, *An Impartial and Succinct History of the Rise, Declension, and Revival of the Church of Christ; from the Birth of Our Savior to the Present Time...*, 3 vols. (1800).
- 53. William (or Willem) Sewel, The History of the Rise, Increase, and Progress, of the Christian People called Quakers: Intermixed with Several Remarkable Occurrences. Written Originally in Low-Dutch, and also Translated into English (1718), reprinted several times in London and also in Philadelphia in the 1720s and then (after decades of latency) undergoing renewed success in London with a third edition in 1795, a fourth in 1799-1800, and a fifth in 1811; Thomas Wight, A History of the Rise and Progress of the People called Quakers in Ireland, from the year 1653 to 1700... (Dublin, 1751), 2<sup>nd</sup> edition published in London in 1800; David Cranz (1723-1777), The Ancient and Modern History of the Brethren: or, a Succinct Narrative of the Protestant

Church of the United Brethren, or, Unitas Fratrum, in the Remoter Ages, and Particularly in the Present Century . . . , trans. Benjamin La Trobe (1780); Select Narrative Extracted from the History of the Church Known by the Name of Unitas Fratrum; or United Brethren . . . , trans. Christian Ignatius Latrobe (1806); Morgan Edwards, Materials Towards a History of the American Baptists . . . , vol. 1 (Philadelphia, 1770), vol. 2 published in 1792; Isaac Backus, A History of New-England, with Particular Reference to the Denomination of Christians called Baptists . . . , 3 vols. (Boston/Providence, RI, 1777/1784/1796; vols. 1 and 2 reprinted in London in 1793; abridgment published in Boston, 1804).

- R. K. Webb, "Robinson, Anthony (1762-1827)," DNB, doi:10.1093/ref:odnb-/23829 (accessed 18 May 2012).
- 55. Anthony Robinson, *A Short History of the Persecution of Christians* . . . (Carlisle, 1793). This work was republished in London in 1794.
- 56. See the preliminary list of Foxe-derived martyrological works appended in Nicholson, "Eighteenth-Century Foxe," 175-76.
- 57. James Baldwin Brown the Elder, An Historical Account of the Laws Enacted Against the Catholics, Both in England and Ireland . . . (1813). On Brown, see Thompson Cooper, "Brown, James Baldwin, the elder (1785-1843)," rev. Jonathan Harris, DNB, doi:10.1093/ref:odnb/3615 (accessed 18 May 2012).
- 58. John Gould, *Historical Account of the Reformation from the Church of Rome* ... (1814).
- 59. For example, Cotton Mather, Magnalia Christi Americana: or, the Ecclesiastical History of New-England, from its First Planting in the Year 1620. unto the Year of our Lord, 1698... (1702); Ferdinando Warner, The Ecclesiastical History of England, to the Eighteenth Century ..., 2 vols. (1756-1757), also appearing under the title The History of England, as it Relates to Religion and the Church, from the Earliest Accounts to the Present Century ..., 2 vols. (1759); and John Skinner, An Ecclesiastical History of Scotland, from the First Appearance of Christianity in that Kingdom, to the Present Time ..., 2 vols. (1788).
- 60. Examples of histories reflecting the above-named themes include: Robert Millar (1672-1752), The History of the Propagation of Christianity, and Overthrow of Paganism ..., 2 vols. (Edinburgh, 1723; republished in London in 1726 and 1731); George Reynolds, An Historical Essay upon the Government of the Church of England, from the Earliest to the Present Times ... (1743, written as a rebuttal to a recently published Roman Catholic account of English church history in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries); Joseph Priestley, An History of the Corruptions of Christianity..., 2 vols. (Birming-

ham, 1782; republished in 1793, and 1797 in Boston); and William Guirey, *The History of Episcopacy, in Four Parts, from its Rise to the Present Day*. . . (Raleigh [?], ca. 1799) which culminated in the formation of the American Methodist Episcopal Church.

- 61. Isaac Sharpe, earlier highlighted as a public defender of the religious establishment, displayed his critical attitude towards dissent in his suggestively titled *Historical Account of the Rise and Growth of Heresie in the Christian Church, to the Sixteenth Century and Farther* (1718-1719). From the opposite vantage point, in 1736 Dissenting minister and theologian Samuel Chandler issued a *History of Persecution* . . . stringing together the suffering experienced by Christians from four successive spheres: heathen Roman rulers, Christian emperors, Roman Catholic papacy and Inquisition, and magisterial Protestants. Later in the century, the Independency of clergyman James Murray helps to explain despite his claim to have "an impartial hand" his interest in his *History of Religion* . . . (4 vols., 1764) to represent historical Christianity through its various branches or denominations, from Roman Catholics to Lutherans, Presbyterians, Congregationalists, Baptists, even Non-jurors, Moravians, Methodists, Quakers, and Antinomians.
- 62. John Brown, A General History of the Christian Church, from the Birth of our Saviour to the Present Time . . . , 2 vols. (Edinburgh, 1771); and William Graham, An Ecclesiastical History, from the Birth of John the Baptist to the Present Times (Newcastle upon Tyne, 1777).
- 63. John Wesley, *A Concise Ecclesiastical History*..., 4 vols. (1781). This work may have served as a rebuttal to a 1766 publication, a two-volume *Ecclesiastical History; from the Birth of Christ, to the Present Time*... translated from the work of Jean-Henri-Samuel Formey, to which the anonymous translator appended a somewhat scathing "account of the people called Methodists."
- 64. Johann Lorenz von Mosheim, *An Ecclesiastical History* ..., 2 vols., trans. and ed. Archibald Maclaine (1765).
- 65. Cameron, Interpreting Church History, 149.
- 66. Dickens and Tonkin, Reformation in Historical Thought, 134.
- 67. Louis Ellies Du Pin, A Compendious History of the Church . . . , 4 vols. (1713). This underwent two further editions within the subsequent decade.
- 68. Thomas Hobbes, A True Ecclesiastical History, from Moses, to the Time of Martin Luther..., trans. John Rooke (1722).

- 69. Millar, History of the Propagation of Christianity, and The History of the Church under the Old Testament, from the Creation of the World . . . (Edinburgh, 1730).
- 70. John Sabine, A Chronology of Sacred and Ecclesiastical History, from the Creation of the World to the present period . . . (1812).
- Anonymous, Monthly Review 52 (1775): 117-20, quoted by John F. Wilson in Jonathan Edwards, A History of the Work of Redemption, ed. J.F. Wilson, vol. 9 of the Works of Jonathan Edwards (New Haven, CT & London: Yale University Press, 1989), 86-87.
- Edwards, *History of the Work of Redemption*, 26-27; and Thomas H. Johnson, *The Printed Writings of Jonathan Edwards*, 1703-1758: A Bibliography (Princeton, NJ & London: Princeton University Press & Oxford University Press, 1940), 85-90.
- 73. [Charles Walmesley], *The General History of the Christian Church* . . . (London [?], 1771).
- 74. Granville Penn, A Christian's Survey of All the Primary Events and Periods of the World... (1811).
- Charlotte Fell-Smith, "Penn, Granville (1761-1844)," rev. Richard Smail, DNB, doi:10.1093/ref:odnb/21847 (accessed 23 May 2012).
- 76. James Tyrrell, The General History of England, both Ecclesiastical and Civil ..., 3 vols. (1696-1704). Tyrrell was grandson of James Ussher, archbishop of Armagh; see Mark Goldie, "Tyrrell, James (1642-1718)," DNB, doi:10.1093/ref:odnb/27953 (accessed 22 May 2012).
- 77. The following two works illustrate earlier and later examples of the above tendency: A History of the Whole Realm of Scotland, Civil, Natural, and Ecclesiastical... (Edinburgh, 1760); and John Malham, The Grand National History of England, Civil and Ecclesiastical, from the Earliest Period of Genuine Record to the Year 1815... (n.p., 1815). The decisiveness of the shift in priority is perhaps reinforced by Malham's strong religious credentials: he was a former clergyman, author of a life of Christ, and producer of an edition of Foxe's Book of Martyrs; see Gordon Goodwin, "Malham, John (bap. 1747, d. 1821)," rev. S. J. Skedd, DNB, doi:10.1093/ref:odnb/17882 (accessed 22 May 2012).
- Encyclopædia Britannica; or, a Dictionary of Arts, Sciences, &c. On a Plan Entirely New..., 2<sup>nd</sup> ed., 10 vols. (Edinburgh, 1778-1783).
- 79. Benjamin Trumbull, A General History of the United States of America: from the Discovery in 1492... (Boston, 1810).

- 80. This number does not include all subsequent editions or re-printings. One should also allow for the limiting factor of my search terms, as well as my decision to disregard titles which focused on church architecture or on particular congregations or buildings, or which appeared to be treatises theological or otherwise only partially making use of history for argumentative purposes.
- 81. See, for example, Jonathan Scott, England's Troubles: Seventeenth-Century English Political Instability in European Context (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000); I am grateful to Todd Webb for drawing my attention to this title. Historiographers Dickens and Tonkin in Reformation in Historical Thought, comment in relation to seventeenth-century England that its "peculiar lot [though arguably Scotland and New England could be added] was to be not so much wrestling with the Reformation legacy as still undergoing the Reformation process, whose results were by no means assured" (100). Beyond century's end, it is presumed, a more "detached" and scholarly, less partisan perspective ensued. Summarizing the direction of English historiographical writing with a focus on learned figures such as Bishop Burnet, they state: "After the revolution of 1688 the mob continued to shout 'No Popery,' but the intellectuals found such emotions irrelevant for an age which had outgrown the triangular clash of Roman, Laudian, and Puritan" (101). In my view, this fails to capture the endurance into the eighteenth century of a diversity of perspectives among the educated class which these authors limit to the seventeenth.
- 82. Recent research on the long reach of Foxe's *Book of Martyrs* observes this connection. Eirwen Nicholson argues that after the Glorious Revolution, the publication of Foxe-derived works "appear[ed] sensitive to the vulnerability of a Protestant succession." She offers several examples from the first half of the eighteenth century and speculates that a similar correlation could be found post-1750. Nicholson, "Eighteenth-Century Foxe," 154 and 154 n. 39.
- 83. Important examples include Linda Colley's influential book Britons: Forging the Nation 1707-1837, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2009), the first chapter of which highlights the sustained and at times stubborn Protestantism of the British people during this period; and Carla Gardina Pestana, Protestant Empire: Religion and the Making of the British Atlantic World (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2009).
- 84. This role is more readily drawn by scholars concerned with the early modern period. An obvious example is Bruce Gordon, ed., *Protestant History and Identity in Sixteenth-Century Europe*, 2 vols. (Aldershot: Scolar Press, 1996). Euan Cameron, writing of church history in the "confessional" age of the latter sixteenth to mid-seventeenth centuries, recognizes the link between history and self-perception in his critical observation that the various religious

camps' histories "constructed an image of their past, and its relationship to their present, that vindicated their own identity and values." See Cameron, *Interpreting Christian History*, 145. For Cameron, this was a feature which happily began to disintegrate with the more critical, less dogmatic spirit of the Enlightenment.